Full text available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1561/0500000007

Share Repurchases

Share Repurchases

Theo Vermaelen

INSEAD Boulevard de Constance 77305 Fontainebleau, France

theo.vermaelen@insead.edu



Boston - Delft

Foundations and $Trends^{\mathbb{R}}$ in Finance

Published, sold and distributed by: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 1024 Hanover, MA 02339 USA Tel. +1 781 871 0245 www.nowpublishers.com sales@nowpublishers.com

Outside North America: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 179 2600 AD Delft The Netherlands Tel. +31-6-51115274

A Cataloging-in-Publication record is available from the Library of Congress

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN: 1-933019-16-6; ISSNs: Paper version 1567-2395;

Electronic version 1567-2409

© 2005 T. Vermaelen

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

now Publishers Inc. has an exclusive license to publish this material worldwide. Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright license holder. Please apply to now Publishers, PO Box 179, 2600 AD Delft, The Netherlands, www.nowpublishers.com; e-mail: sales@nowpublishers.com

Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Repurchase Methods	3
2.1	Fixed price tender offer	3
2.2	Dutch auction tender offer	5
2.3	Private or targeted share repurchases	7
2.4	Open market share repurchase	7
2.5	Synthetic repurchases or repurchases	
	"enhanced with derivatives"	9
	Share Repurchase: Regulatory, Tax and Other Drivers	13
3.1	The importance of share buybacks around the world	13
3.2	Regulation	19
3.3	Taxation	44
3.4	Attitudes toward shareholder value maximization	46
3.5	The use of executive stock options	47
4	The Economic Consequences of Share Repurchases:	
	The Short Run	49

Full text available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1561/0500000007

vi	Contents	
4.1	The effect of share repurchases on stock prices	49
4.2	International evidence	59
4.3	Anomalous price behavior around tender offers	62
5	Why Do Stock Prices Increase Around Buyback	
	Announcements?	67
5.1	Corporate tax benefits	68
5.2	Personal tax benefits	69
5.3	Bondholder expropriation	70
5.4	Reducing agency costs of free cash flow	70
5.5	Signaling	72
5.6	Option to take advantage of the uninformed	77
6	When Do Companies Repurchase Shares?	79
6.1	US evidence	80
6.2	International evidence	84
6.3	The bottom line	85
7	Dividends Versus Share Repurchase	87
8	Conclusion and Implications	91
Re	ferences	97

1

Introduction

What makes share repurchases interesting? In some ways, a share repurchase is a microcosm of corporate finance. First, it is an *investment* decision, an investment in itself, as opposed to investing in capital goods or buying another company. Second, it is a *payout* decision, as an alternative to paying a dividend. Third, it is a *capital structure* decision as it increases the company's financial leverage. Fourth, it is a decision to change the *ownership structure* of the company, in particular considering that managers and insiders don't sell their shares back to the company. The all encompassing nature of a repurchase also means that the references in this manuscript will be inevitably incomplete, as a massive body of research in corporate finance is either directly or indirectly related to share buybacks.

Share repurchases have also become an important and a global activity in recent years, as opposed to a minor activity only relevant in US markets. For example, when I wrote my doctoral dissertation on share repurchases in the late seventies, I had to look back for 15 years to collect a few hundred repurchase announcements. Today, I would only have to look back a few months. Share repurchases were also largely inexistent outside the US. Today, non-US buyback activity has become as important as in the US.

2 Introduction

The purpose of this text is to provide an overview of research on stock repurchases, hopefully to encourage others to research this exciting event. I also have tried to give my personal interpretation of the numerous research results published during the last 25 years. The text starts with a description of the various methods to repurchase stock and the growing importance of buybacks around the world. Section 3 discusses the importance of the institutional environment, i.e. regulation and taxes, for the emergence of share repurchase activity. Section 4 provides an overview of short-term event-studies around repurchase announcements. The general conclusion is that, regardless of the repurchase method, stock prices increase significantly. Section 5 discusses to what extent various theories can explain this price increase. Section 6 shows that managers are able to time the market buy buying back stock when the shares are undervalued. Section 7 compares dividends and repurchases. Finally Section 8 summarizes the main findings and implications for corporate financial policy.

- [1] J. Aharony and I. Swary, "Quarterly dividend and earnings announcements and stockholder returns: An empirical analysis," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 35, no. 1, pp. 1–12, 1980.
- [2] F. Allen, A. Bernardo, and I. Welch, "A theory of dividends based on tax clientele," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 55, no. 6, pp. 2499–2536, 2000.
- [3] F. Allen and R. Michaely, "Payout policy," in North Holland Handbooks of Economics (G. Constantinides, M. Harris, and R. Stulz, eds.), 2003.
- [4] V. Atanasov, S. Gyoshev, S. Szezcyk, and G. Tsetsekos, "Why large financial institutions buy long-term put options from companies," Working Paper, Drexel University, 2004.
- [5] M. Bagnoli, R. Gordon, and B. L. Lipman, "Stock repurchase as a takeover defense," *Review of Financial Studies*, vol. 2, pp. 423–443, 1989.
- [6] L. S. Bagwell, "Shareholder heterogeneity: Evidence and implications," American Economic Review, vol. 81, no. 2, pp. 218–221, 1991.
- [7] L. Bagwell, "Dutch auction repurchases: An analysis of shareholder heterogeneity," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 47, no. 1, pp. 71–140, 1992.
- [8] M. J. Barclay and C. W. Smith, "Corporate payout policy: Cash dividends versus open market repurchases," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 22, pp. 61–82, 1988.
- [9] T. Barnes, D. Burnie, and E. Gunay, "Note sur les rachats via bourse au Canada (1987–1995)," FINECO, vol. 7, no. 2, 1997.
- [10] E. Bartov, "Open market stock repurchases as signals and risk-changes," Journal of Accounting and Economics, vol. 14, pp. 275–294, 1991.
- [11] H. Bierman and R. West, "The acquisition of common stock by the corporate issuer," *Journal of Finance*, p. 687, December 1966.

- [12] F. Black, "The dividend puzzle," Journal of Portfolio Management, vol. 2, pp. 5–8, 1976.
- [13] M. Bradley and L. Wakeman, "The wealth effect of targeted share repurchases," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 11, pp. 301–328, 1983.
- [14] A. Brav, J. R. Graham, C. R. Harvey, and R. Michaely, "Payout policy in the 21st century," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 77, pp. 483–528, 2005.
- [15] P. Brockman and D. Y. Chung, "Managerial timing and corporate liquidity: Evidence from actual share repurchases," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 61, pp. 417–448, 2001.
- [16] D. Brounen, A. de Jong, and K. Koedijk, "Corporate finance in Europe: Confronting theory with practice," *Financial Management*, vol. 33, no. 4, pp. 61–101, 2004.
- [17] K. Chan, D. L. Ikenberry, and I. Lee, "Do firms knowingly repurchase stock for good reasons?," Working Paper, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 2001.
- [18] F. Choi and S. Chen, "The differential information conveyed by share repurchase tender offers and dividend increases," *Journal of Financial Research*, vol. 20, pp. 529–543, 1997.
- [19] B. Chowdhry and V. Nanda, "Repurchase premia as a reason for dividends: A dynamic model of corporate payout policies," *Review of Financial Studies*, vol. 7, pp. 321–350, 1994.
- [20] R. Comment and G. Jarrell, "The relative power of Dutch-auction and fixed-priced self-tender offers and open market share repurchases," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 46, no. 4, pp. 1243–1271, 1991.
- [21] D. O. Cook, L. Krigman, and J. C. Leach, "An analysis of SEC guidelines for executing open market repurchases," *Journal of Business*, vol. 68, pp. 289–315, 2003
- [22] D. O. Cook, L. Krigman, and J. C. Leach, "On the timing and execution of open market repurchases," *Review of Financial Studies*, vol. 17, pp. 463–498, 2004
- [23] L. Dann and H. De Angelo, "Standstill agreements, privately negotiated stock repurchases and the market for corporate control," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 11, pp. 275–300, 1983.
- [24] L. Y. Dann, "Common stock repurchases: An analysis of returns to bondholders and stockholders," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 9, pp. 113–138, 1081
- [25] L. Dann, R. Masulis, and D. Mayers, "Repurchase tender offers and earnings information," *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, vol. 14, pp. 217–251, 1991.
- [26] D. J. Denis, "Defensive changes in corporate payout policy: Share repurchases and special dividends," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 45, pp. 1433–1456, 1990.
- [27] S. Dereeper and F. Romon, "The use of open market repurchase programs in France," Working Paper, Europlace Institute of Finance, 2003.
- [28] A. Ditmar, "Why do firms repurchase stock?," Journal of Business, vol. 73, pp. 331–355, 2000.

- [29] R. D'Mello and P. K. Schroff, "Equity undervaluation and decisions related to repurchase tender offers: An empirical investigation," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 55, pp. 2399–2424, 2000.
- [30] A. Dunsby, "Share repurchases, dividends and corporate distribution policy," Working Paper, Wharton School of the University of Pennsylvania, 1994.
- [31] E. Fama and K. French, "Common risk facts in the returns of bonds and stocks," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 33, pp. 3–56, 1993.
- [32] E. Fama and K. French, "Financing decisions: Who issues stock?," Journal of Financial Economics, vol. 76, pp. 549–582, 2005.
- [33] E. Fama, "Market efficiency, long-term returns and behavioral finance," Journal of Financial Economics, vol. 49, pp. 283–306, 1998.
- [34] G. W. Fenn and N. Liang, "Corporate payout policy and managerial stock incentives," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 60, pp. 45–72, 2001.
- [35] D. Franz, R. Rao, and N. Tripathy, "Informed trading risk and bid-ask spread changes around open market repurchases in the Nasdaq market," *Journal of Financial Research*, vol. 18, pp. 311–327, 1995.
- [36] J. Fried, "Insider signaling and insider trading with repurchase tender offers," University of Chicago Law Review, vol. 67, no. 421, 2000.
- [37] J.-M. Gaspar, M. Massa, P. Matos, R. Patgiri, and Z. Rehman, "Can buybacks be a product of shorter time horizons?," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 76, no. 1, pp. 135–166, 2005.
- [38] G. D. Gay, J. R. Kale, and T. N. Noe, "Dutch auction share repurchases," Economica, vol. 63, pp. 57–80, 1996.
- [39] W. Gray, "The self-tender repurchase anomaly," Working Paper, University of Chicago, 2005.
- [40] G. Grullon and D. Ikenberry, "What do we know about stock repurchase?," *Journal of Applied Corporate Finance*, vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 31–51, 2000.
- [41] G. Grullon and R. Michaely, "Dividends, share repurchases and the substitution hypothesis," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 57, pp. 1649–1684, 2002.
- [42] G. Grullon and R. Michaely, "The information content of share repurchase programs," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 59, pp. 651–680, 2004.
- [43] W. Guay and J. Harford, "The cash-flow permanence and information content of dividend increases versus repurchases," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 57, no. 3, pp. 385–415, 2000.
- [44] M. Hertzel and P. Jain, "Earnings and risk changes around repurchase tender offers," *Journal of Accounting and Economics*, vol. 14, pp. 252–274, 1991.
- [45] A. Hovakimian, T. Opler, and S. Titman, "The debt-equity choice," *Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis*, vol. 36, pp. 1–23, 2001.
- [46] D. Ikenberry and T. Vermaelen, "The option to repurchase stock," Financial Management, pp. 9–24, Winter 1996.
- [47] D. Ikenberry, J. Lakonishok, and T. Vermaelen, "Market underreaction to open market repurchases," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 39, pp. 181– 208, 1995.
- [48] D. Ikenberry, J. Lakonishok, and T. Vermaelen, "Stock repurchases in Canada: Performance and strategic trading," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 55, pp. 2373–2397, 2000.

- [49] N. Isagawa, "Open market repurchase and stock price behavior when management values real investment," The Financial Review, vol. 25, pp. 95–108, 2000.
- [50] D. Isakov and C. Perignon, "Repurchasing shares as a second trading line," Working Paper, Simon Fraser University, 2005.
- [51] M. Jagannathan, C. Stephens, and M. Weisbach, "Financial flexibility and the choice between dividends and stock repurchases," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 57, pp. 355–384, 2000.
- [52] M. C. Jensen and W. H. Meckling, "Theory of the firm: Managerial behavior, agency costs and ownership structure," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 3, no. 4, pp. 305–360, 1976.
- [53] M. C. Jensen, "Agency costs of free cash flow, corporate finance and takeovers," American Economic Review, vol. 76, no. 2, pp. 323–329, 1986.
- [54] M. Jensen, "The agency costs of overvalued equity and the current state of corporate finance," *European Financial Management*, vol. 10, no. 5, pp. 545– 548, 2004.
- [55] C. Jolls, "The role of incentive compensation in explaining the stock repurchase puzzle," Mimeo, Harvard Business School, 1998.
- [56] P.-R. Kadapakkam and S. Seth, "Trading profits in Dutch auction tender offers," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 43, no. 1, pp. 294–306, 1994.
- [57] P.-R. Kadapakkam and S. Yildirim, "Examination of tender offer stock repurchases by closed-end funds," Working Paper, University of Texas at Austin, 2004.
- [58] K. M. Kahle, E. Dyl, and M. Banyi, "Measuring share repurchases," Working Paper, University of Arizona, 2005.
- [59] K. M. Kahle, "When a buyback isn't a buyback: Open market repurchases and employee options," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 63, pp. 235–261, 2002
- [60] J. Kale, T. Noe, and G. Gay, "Share repurchase through transferable put rights: Theory and a case study," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 25, pp. 141–160, 1989.
- [61] S. Kamma, G. Kanatas, and S. Raymar, "Dutch auction versus fixed-price self tender offers for common stock," *Journal of Financial Intermediation*, vol. 2, pp. 277–307, 1992.
- [62] K. Klassen and R. Sivakumar, "Stock repurchases associated with stock options do represent dollars out of shareholders wealth," Working Paper, University of Waterloo, 2001.
- [63] A. Klein and J. Rosenfeld, "The impact of targeted repurchases on the wealth of non-participating shareholders," *The Journal of Financial Research*, vol. XI, pp. 89–97, 1988.
- [64] B. Kracher and R. R. Johnson, "Repurchase announcements, lies and false signals," *Journal of Business Ethics*, pp. 1677–1685, 1997.
- [65] J. Lakonishok and T. Vermaelen, "Anomalous price behavior around repurchase tender offers," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 45, no. 2, pp. 455–477, 1990.
- [66] W. Lane, "Managerial discretion in the repurchase of common stock," Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. 1976.

- [67] M. A. Lasfer, "The market valuation of share repurchases in Europe," Working Paper, City University Business School, 2002.
- [68] H. Leland and D. Pyle, "Information asymmetries, financial structure and financial intermediatoin," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 35, pp. 305–319, 1977.
- [69] E. Lie and H. J. Lie, "The role of personal taxes in corporate decisions: An empirical analysis of share repurchases and dividends," *Journal of Financial* and Quantitative Analysis, vol. 24, pp. 533–552, 1999.
- [70] E. Lie, "Do firms undertake self-tender offers to optimize capital structure?," Journal of Business, vol. 75, pp. 603–638, 2002.
- [71] E. Liljeblom and D. Pasternack, "Share repurchases, dividends and executive options: The effect of dividend protection," *European Financial Management*, 2005. Forthcoming.
- [72] R. Litzenberger and K. Ramaswamy, "The effects of dividends on common stock price: Tax effects or information effects," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 37, pp. 429–443, 1982.
- [73] K. Li and W. McNally, "Information signaling or agency conflicts: What explains Canadian open market repurchases?," Working Paper, University of British Columbia, 1999.
- [74] T. Loughran and J. Ritter, "Uniformly least powerful test of market efficiency," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 55, pp. 361–389, 2000.
- [75] M.-O. Lucke and D. Pindur, "Riding the hat curve; Why shareholders should tender their shares in repurchase programs," Financial Markets and Portfolio Management, vol. 11, pp. 358–377, 2002.
- [76] K. R. Marks, "The stock market performance of firms repurchasing their own shares," The Bulletin, vol. 1, pp. 1–73, 1976. New York Graduate School of Business.
- [77] Y. Masui, "Taxation of share repurchases in Japan," European Taxation, pp. 416–419, November/December 1998.
- [78] R. Masulis, "Stock repurchase by tender offer: An analysis of the causes of common stock price changes," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 35, pp. 305–321, 1980.
- [79] W. F. Maxwell and C. Stephens, "The wealth effect of repurchases on bond-holders," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 58, pp. 895–919, 2003.
- [80] W. McNally, "Open market repurchase signaling," Financial Management, vol. 28, pp. 55–67, 1999.
- [81] W. Mikkelson and R. Ruback, "Targeted repurchases and common stock returns," RAND Journal of Economics, vol. 22, pp. 544–561, 1991.
- [82] J. Miller and J. McConnell, "Open market share repurchase programs and bidask spreads on the NYSE: Implications for corporate payout policy," *Journal* of Financial and Quantitative Analysis, vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 365–382, 1995.
- [83] M. H. Miller and M. S. Scholes, "Dividends and taxes: some empirical evidence," *Journal of Political Economy*, vol. 90, pp. 1118–1141, 1982.
- [84] M. Mitchell and E. Stafford, "Managerial decisions and long-term stock price performance," *Journal of Business*, vol. 73, pp. 287–329, 2000.
- [85] S. C. Myers and N. S. Majluf, "Corporate financing and investment decisions when firms have information that investors do not have," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 147–175, 1984.

- [86] S. C. Myers, "Determinants of corporate borrowing," Journal of Financial Economics, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 147–175, 1977.
- [87] J. M. Netter and M. L. Mitchell, "Stock repurchase announcements and insider transactions after the October 87 crash," *Financial Management*, vol. 18, pp. 84–96, 1989.
- [88] T. Nohel and V. Tarhan, "Share repurchases and firm performance; new evidence on the agency costs of free cash flow," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 49, pp. 187–222, 1998.
- [89] J. Oded, "Why do firms announce open-market repurchase programs?," Review of Financial Studies, vol. 18, no. 1, 2004.
- [90] A. R. Ofer and A. V. Thakor, "A theory of stock responses to alternative corporate cash distribution methods: Stock repurchases and dividends," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 42, no. 2, pp. 365–394, 1987.
- [91] D. Oswald and S. Young, "What role taxes and regulation? A second look at open market repurchase activity in the United Kingdom," *Journal of Business Finance and Accounting*, vol. 31, no. 1–2, pp. 257–292, 2004.
- [92] S. B. Perfect, D. R. Peterson, and P. P. Peterson, "Self-tender offers: The effect of free cash flow, cash-flow signaling and measurement of Tobin's q," *Journal of Banking and Finance*, vol. 19, pp. 1005–1023, 1995.
- [93] J. C. Persons, "Signaling and takeover deterrence with stock repurchases: Dutch auction versus fixed price tender offers," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 49, pp. 1373–1402, 1994.
- [94] U. Peyer and T. Vermaelen, "The many facets of privately negotiated share repurchases," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 75, pp. 361–395, 2005a.
- [95] U. Peyer and T. Vermaelen, "The nature and persistence of buyback anomalies," Working Paper, INSEAD, 2005b.
- [96] G. E. Porter, R. L. Roenfeldt, and N. W. Sicherman, "The value of open market repurchases of closed-end fund shares," *Journal of Business*, vol. 72, no. 2, pp. 257–276, 1999.
- [97] E. Raad and H. K. Wu, "Insider trading effects on stock returns around open market repurchase announcements: An empirical study," *Journal of Financial Research*, vol. 43, no. 1, pp. 45–57, 1995.
- [98] R. Rau and T. Vermaelen, "Regulation, taxes and share repurchases in the United Kingdom," *Journal of Business*, pp. 245–282, 2002.
- [99] W. Rees, "The impact of open market equity repurchases on UK equity prices," European Journal of Finance, vol. 53, pp. 353–370, 1996.
- [100] S. Ross, "The determination of financial structure: The incentive signaling approach," Bell Journal of Economics, vol. 8, pp. 3–29, 1977.
- [101] W. G. Schwert, "Anomalies and Market Efficiency," in *Handbook of the Economics of Finance*, vol. 21, Elsevier, North Holland, 2003.
- [102] L. Scott, W. H. Mikkelson, and M. M. Partch, "Managerial trading around share repurchases," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 47, pp. 1947–1961, 1992.
- [103] L. Shyam-Sunder and S. Myers, "Testing static tradeoff against pecking order models of capital structure," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 51, pp. 219–244, 1999.

- [104] A. K. Singh, M. A. Zaman, and C. Krishnamurti, "Liquidity changes associated with open market repurchases," Financial Management, vol. 23, pp. 47–55, 1994.
- [105] S. Sinha, "Share repurchase as a takeover defense," Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis, vol. 26, no. 2, pp. 233–244, 1991.
- [106] C. Stephens and M. Weisbach, "Actual share reacquisitions in open market repurchase programs," *Journal of Finance*, vol. 53, pp. 313–333, 1998.
- [107] R. M. Stulz, "Managerial control of voting rights: Financing policies and the market for corporate control," *Journal of Financial Economics*, vol. 20, pp. 25–54, 1988.
- [108] G. Tsetsekos, D. Kaufman, and L. Gitman, "A survey of stock repurchase motivations and practices of major corporations," The Journal of Applied Business Research, pp. 15–21, 1998.
- [109] N. Vafeas and O. M. Joy, "Open market repurchases and the free cash flow hypothesis," *Economic Letters*, vol. 48, pp. 405–410, 1995.
- [110] T. Vermaelen, "Common stock repurchases and market signaling," Journal of Financial Economics, vol. 9, pp. 139–183, 1981.
- [111] T. Vermaelen, "Repurchase tender offers, signaling and managerial incentives," Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis, vol. 19, pp. 163–181, 1984
- [112] J. W. Wansley, W. Lane, and S. Sarkar, "Management's view on share repurchase and tender offer premiums," Financial Management, pp. 97–110, 1989.
- [113] S. J. Weisbenner, "Corporate share repurchases in the 1990s: What role do stock options play?," Working Paper, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 2000.
- [114] J. F. Weston, M. L. Mitchell, and J. J. Mulherin, *Takeovers, Restructuring and Corporate Governance*. Fourth ed., 2004. Pearson Education Inc.
- [115] J. F. Weston and J. A. Siu, "Changing motives for share repurchases," Working Paper, Andersen Graduate School of Management, UCLA, 2003.
- [116] J. B. Wiggins, "Open market stock repurchase programs and liquidity," Journal of Financial Economics, vol. 17, pp. 217–229, 1994.
- [117] H. Zhang, "Share repurchases under the commercial law 212-2 in Japan: Market reaction and actual implementation," *Pacific-Based Finance Journal*, vol. 10, pp. 287–305, 2002.
- [118] H. Zhang, "Share price performance following actual share repurchases," Journal of Banking and Finance, vol. 29, pp. 1887–1901, 2005.