Financial Analysts' Forecasts and Stock Recommendations: A Review of the Research

Financial Analysts' Forecasts and Stock Recommendations: A Review of the Research

Sundaresh Ramnath

University of Miami Coral Gables, FL 33146-6531 USA S.Ramnath@Miami.edu

Steve Rock

The University of Colorado at Boulder Boulder, CO 80309-0419 USA Steven.Rock@Colorado.edu

Philip B. Shane

The University of Auckland Business School
Auckland
New Zealand
P.Shane@Auckland.ac.nz



Boston - Delft

Foundations and Trends[®] in Finance

Published, sold and distributed by: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 1024 Hanover, MA 02339 USA Tel. +1-781-985-4510 www.nowpublishers.com sales@nowpublishers.com

Outside North America: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 179 2600 AD Delft The Netherlands Tel. +31-6-51115274

The preferred citation for this publication is S. Ramnath, S. Rock and P. B. Shane, Financial Analysts' Forecasts and Stock Recommendations: A Review of the Research, Foundations and Trends in Finance, vol 2, no 4, pp 311–421, 2006

ISBN: 978-1-60198-162-2 © 2008 S. Ramnath, S. Rock and P. B. Shane

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

Photocopying. In the USA: This journal is registered at the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, or the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by now Publishers Inc for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC). The 'services' for users can be found on the internet at: www.copyright.com

For those organizations that have been granted a photocopy license, a separate system of payment has been arranged. Authorization does not extend to other kinds of copying, such as that for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. In the rest of the world: Permission to photocopy must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to now Publishers Inc., PO Box 1024, Hanover, MA 02339, USA; Tel. +1-781-871-0245; www.nowpublishers.com; sales@nowpublishers.com

now Publishers Inc. has an exclusive license to publish this material worldwide. Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright license holder. Please apply to now Publishers, PO Box 179, 2600 AD Delft, The Netherlands, www.nowpublishers.com; e-mail: sales@nowpublishers.com

Foundations and Trends[®] in Finance

Volume 2 Issue 4, 2006

Editorial Board

Editor-in-Chief:

George M. Constantinides

Leo Melamed Professor of Finance
The University of Chicago
Graduate School of Business
5807 South Woodlawn Avenue
Chicago IL 60637
USA
gmc@gsb.uchicago.edu

Editors

Franklin Allen

Nippon Life Professor of Finance and Economics, The Wharton School, The University of Pennsylvania

Andrew W. Lo

 $Harris\ \mathcal{E}\ Harris\ Group\ Professor,\ Sloan\ School\ of\ Management,$ $Massachusetts\ Institute\ of\ Technology$

René M. Stulz

Everett D. Reese Chair of Banking and Monetary Economics, Fisher College of Business, The Ohio State University

Editorial Scope

Foundations and Trends[®] in Finance will publish survey and tutorial articles in the following topics:

- Corporate Governance
- Corporate Financing
- Dividend Policy and Capital Structure
- Corporate Control
- Investment Policy
- Agency Theory and Information
- Market Microstructure
- Portfolio Theory
- Financial Intermediation
- Investment Banking
- Market Efficiency
- Security Issuance
- Anomalies and Behavioral Finance
- Asset-Pricing Theory

- Asset-Pricing Models
- Tax Effects
- Liquidity
- Equity Risk Premium
- Pricing Models and Volatility
- Fixed Income Securities
- Computational Finance
- Futures Markets and Hedging
- Financial Engineering
- Interest Rate Derivatives
- Credit Derivatives
- Financial Econometrics
- Estimating Volatilities and Correlations

Information for Librarians

Foundations and Trends[®] in Finance, 2006, Volume 2, 4 issues. ISSN paper version 1567-2395. ISSN online version 1567-2409. Also available as a combined paper and online subscription.

Foundations and Trends[®] in Finance Vol. 2, No. 4 (2006) 311–421 © 2008 S. Ramnath, S. Rock and P. B. Shane DOI: 10.1561/0500000023



Financial Analysts' Forecasts and Stock Recommendations: A Review of the Research

Sundaresh Ramnath¹, Steve Rock² and Philip B. Shane^{3,4}

- School of Business Administration, University of Miami, Coral Gables, FL 33146-6531, USA, S.Ramnath@Miami.edu
- ² Leeds School of Business, The University of Colorado at Boulder, Boulder, CO 80309-0419, USA, Steven.Rock@Colorado.edu
- ³ The University of Auckland Business School, Auckland, New Zealand, P.Shane@Auckland.ac.nz
- ⁴ Leeds School of Business, The University of Colorado at Boulder, Boulder, CO 80309-0419, USA, Phil.Shane@Colorado.edu

Abstract

This surveys reviews research regarding the role of financial analysts in capital markets. The survey builds on the perspectives provided by Schipper (1991) and Brown (1993). We categorize papers published mainly since 1992 and selectively discuss aspects of these papers that address or suggest key research topics of ongoing interest in seven broad areas: analysts' decision processes, the determinants of analyst expertise and distributions of individual analysts' forecasts, the informativeness of analysts' research outputs, analyst and market efficiency with respect to information, effects of analysts' economic incentives on their research outputs, effects of the institutional and regulatory environment (including cross-country comparisons), and the limitations of databases and various research paradigms.

Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Perspective From Schipper (1991) and Brown (1993)	5
3	Selective Review of Research Related to the Role of Financial Analysts	9
3.1	Inputs to Analysts' Earnings Forecasts and Stock	
	Recommendations	11
3.2	The Nature of Analyst Expertise and Distributional	
	Characteristics	20
3.3	Information Content of Analysts' Research Output	30
3.4	Market and Analyst Inefficiency	47
3.5	Analysts' Incentives	60
3.6	Regulatory and Cross-Country Comparisons	79
3.7	Research Design and Database Issues	85
4	Summary and Conclusion	91
Acknowledgments		93
References		95

1

Introduction

This survey reviews research related to the role of financial analysts in the allocation of resources in capital markets. Two important papers published in the early 1990s provide perspectives on the literature in this area, one appearing in Accounting Horizons (Schipper, 1991) and the other appearing in the International Journal of Forecasting (Brown, 1993a). Our survey begins by summarizing the perspectives and directions for future research suggested in Schipper (1991) and Brown (1993a). We then take a look at the highlights of what we have learned and new questions that have emerged since 1992. Our goal is to provide an organized look at the literature, with particular attention to important questions that remain open for further research. Brown (1993a) did not restrict his review of earnings forecasting research to the role of financial analysts. We focus more narrowly on research related

¹ Much of this survey reprints, by permission, Ramnath et al. (2008). Ramnath et al. (2008) provide a detailed taxonomy listing and categorizing every paper published in 11 research journals since 1992. This survey differs from Ramnath et al. (2008) in that this survey selectively and critically reviews examples of the research in each of the seven broad areas of the Ramnath et al. (2008) taxonomy.

² Also see Givoly and Lakonishok (1983) for a review of analysts' forecasting research prior to 1983.

2 Introduction

to analysts' decision processes and the usefulness of their forecasts and stock recommendations. Kothari (2001) provides an excellent overall review of capital markets research, and we refer the reader to that paper for a broader perspective.

Since 1992 no less than 250 papers related to financial analysts have appeared in the nine major research journals that we used to launch our review of the literature. We also note that during the six months ending February 21, 2008 alone 154 new working papers with the word "analysts" in the abstract have posted to the Social Sciences Research Network, so the task for the next authors of a review article in this area will be even more daunting.

In our review of papers published since 1992, we find much progress in some of the areas identified by Schipper (1991) and Brown (1993a) and less progress in other areas. In particular, the research has evolved from descriptions of the statistical properties of analysts' forecasts to investigations of the incentives and decision processes that give rise to those properties. However, in spite of this broader focus, much of analysts' decision processes and the market's mechanism of drawing a useful consensus from the combination of individual analysts' decisions remain hidden in a black box. Furthermore, we still have much to learn about the relevant valuation metrics and the mechanism by which analysts and investors translate forecasts into present equity values. For example, with renewed popularity of the earnings-based valuation model in the early 1990s, research turned toward an investigation of the model's role in the market's conversion of analysts' earnings forecasts into current equity values. Given the unexpected result that this model does a relatively poor job of explaining the variation in market prices and analysts' price forecasts and recommendations, researchers have turned their attention to examining heuristics that might better explain analyst and market decisions about firm value. We still have much to learn about the heuristics relied upon by analysts and the market and appropriateness of their use.

The rest of this survey draws attention to these and other issues that have arisen since 1992. The next section provides a summary of the questions identified in Schipper (1991) and Brown (1993a) and the directions for future research suggested by those authors, as well as the

3

authors of the four papers commenting on Brown (1993). Section 3 reviews papers published mainly since Schipper (1991) and Brown (1993a) and also identifies new research questions that emerge from our reading of the literature. Section 4 provides concluding comments highlighting the areas we consider most promising for future research.

- Abarbanell, J. (1991). 'Do analysts' earnings forecasts incorporate information in prior stock price changes?' *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **14**, 147–165.
- Abarbanell, J. and V. Bernard (1992), 'Tests of analysts' overreaction/underreaction to earnings information as an explanation for anomalous stock price behavior'. *Journal of Finance* 47, 1181–1207.
- Abarbanell, J. and B. Bushee (1997), 'Fundamental analysis, future earnings, and stock prices'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **35**, 1–24.
- Abarbanell, J. and B. Bushee (1998), 'Abnormal returns to a fundamental analysis strategy'. *The Accounting Review* **73**(1), 19–45.
- Abarbanell, J. and R. Lehavy (2003), 'Biased forecasts or biased earnings? The role of reported earnings in explaining apparent bias and over/underreaction in analysts' earnings forecasts'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **36**(1–3), 105–146.
- Abarbanell, J. S., W. N. Lanen, and R. E. I. Verrecchia (1995), 'Analysts' forecasts as proxies for investor beliefs in empirical research'. Journal of Accounting and Economics 20, 31–60.
- Agrawal, A. and M. Chen (2007), 'Analyst conflicts and research quality'. Working Paper, University of Alabama and Georgia State University.

- Ahmed, A. S., G. J. Lobo, and X. Zhang (2000), 'Do analysts underreact to bad news and over-react to good news?'. Working Paper, Syracuse University.
- Ali, A., L. Hwang, and M. A. Trombley (2003), 'Residual-income-based valuation predicts future stock returns: Evidence on mispricing vs. risk explanations'. *The Accounting Review* **78**, 377–396.
- Ali, A., A. Klein, and J. Rosenfeld (1992), 'Analysts' use of information about permanent and transitory components in forecasting annual EPS'. *The Accounting Review* **67**, 183–198.
- Asquith, P., M. Mikhail, and A. Au (2005), 'Information content of equity analyst reports'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **75**(2), 245–282.
- Baginski, S. and J. Whalen (2003), 'Residual income risk, intrinsic values, and share prices'. *The Accounting Review* **78**(1), 327–351.
- Bailey, W., H. Li, C. Mao, and R. Zhong (2003), 'Regulation Fair Disclosure and earnings information: Market, analyst and corporate responses'. *Journal of Finance* **63**(6), 2487–2514.
- Bamber, L. S., O. E. Barron, and T. L. Stober (1997), 'Trading volume and different aspects of disagreement coincident with earnings announcements'. *The Accounting Review* **72**, 575–597.
- Bandyopadhyay, S., L. Brown, and G. Richardson (1995), 'Analysts' use of earnings forecasts in predicting stock returns: Forecast horizon effects'. *International Journal of Forecasting* 11, 429–445.
- Barber, B., R. Lehavy, M. McNichols, and B. Trueman (2006), 'Buys, holds, and sells: The distribution of investment banks' stock ratings and implications for the profitability of analysts' recommendations'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 41, 87–117.
- Barber, B., R. Lehavy, M. NcNichols, and B. Trueman (2001), 'Can investors profit from the prophets? Security analyst recommendations and stock returns'. *Journal of Finance* **56**, 531–563.
- Barber, B., R. Lehavy, and B. Trueman (2007), 'Comparing the stock recommendation performance of investment banks and independent research firms'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **85**, 490–517.
- Barberis, N., A. Shleifer, and R. Vishny (1998), 'A model of investor sentiment'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **49**(3), 307–343.

- Barron, O., D. Byard, and O. Kim (2002), 'Changes in analysts' information around earnings announcements'. *The Accounting Review* 77, 821–846.
- Barron, O., C. Kile, and T. O'Keefe (1999), 'MD & A quality as measured by the SEC and analysts' earnings forecasts'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* **16**, 75–109.
- Barron, O. E. (1995), 'Trading volume and belief revisions that differ among individual analysts'. *The Accounting Review* **70**, 581–597.
- Barron, O. E., D. G. Harris, and M. Stanford (2005), 'Evidence that investors trade on private event-period information around earnings announcements'. *The Accounting Review* **80**, 403–421.
- Barron, O. E., O. Kim, S. C. Lim, and D. E. Stevens (1998), 'Using analysts' forecasts to measure properties of analysts' information environment'. *The Accounting Review* **73**, 421–433.
- Barth, M. E. and A. P. Hutton (2004), 'Analyst earnings forecast revisions and the pricing of accruals'. *Review of Accounting Studies* 9, 59–96.
- Bartov, E. and G. M. Bodnar (1994), 'Firm valuation, earnings expectations, and the exchange rate exposure effect'. *Journal of Finance* **49**, 1755–1785.
- Bartov, E., D. Givoly, and C. Hayn (2002), 'The rewards to meeting or beating earnings expectations'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **33**(2), 173–204.
- Basu, S. and S. Markov (2004), 'Loss function assumptions in rational expectations tests on financial analysts' earnings forecasts'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **38**(1–3), 171–203.
- Begley, J. and G. Feltham (2002), 'The relation between market values, earnings forecasts, and reported earnings'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* **19**(1), 1–48.
- Billings, B. K. and R. M. Morton (2001), 'Book-to-market components, future security returns, and errors in expected future earnings'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **39**, 197–220.
- Block, S. (1999), 'A study of financial analysts: practice and theory'. *Financial Analysts Journal* **55**(4), 86–95.
- Boni, L. (2005), 'Analyzing the analysts after the Global Settlement'. Working Paper, University of New Mexico.

- Bonner, S., B. Walther, and S. M. Young (2003), 'Sophistication-related differences in investors' models of the relative accuracy of analysts' forecast revisions'. *The Accounting Review* **78**, 679–706.
- Botosan, C. and M. Harris (2000), 'Motivations for a change in disclosure frequency and its consequences: An examination of voluntary quarterly segment disclosures'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **38**(2), 329–353.
- Botosan, C. and M. Plumlee (2002), 'A re-examination of disclosure level and the expected cost of capital'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **40**(1), 21–40.
- Botosan, C. and M. Plumlee (2005), 'Assessing alternative proxies for the expected risk premium'. *The Accounting Review* **80**(1), 21–53.
- Bouwman, M. and P. Frishkoff (1995), 'The relevance of GAAP-based information: A case study exploring some uses and limitations'. *Accounting Horizons* **9**(4), 22–47.
- Bowen, R., A. Davis, and D. Matsumoto (2002). 'Do conference calls affect analysts' forecasts?' *The Accounting Review* 77, 285–316.
- Bradshaw, M. and R. G. Sloan (2002), 'GAAP versus the street: An empirical assessment of two alternative definitions of earnings'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **40**, 41–66.
- Bradshaw, M. T. (2002), 'The use of target prices to justify sell-side analysts' stock recommendations'. Accounting Horizons 16(1), 27–40.
- Bradshaw, M. T. (2004). 'How do analysts use their earnings forecasts in generating stock recommendations?' The Accounting Review 79, 25–50.
- Bradshaw, M. T., S. A. Richardson, and R. G. Sloan (2001). 'Do analysts and auditors use information in accruals?' *Journal of Accounting Research* **39**, 45–74.
- Branson, B., D. Guffey, and D. Pagach (1998), 'Information conveyed in announcements of analyst coverage'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* **15**, 119–143.
- Brav, A. and R. Lehavy (2003), 'An empirical analysis of analysts' target prices: Short-term informativeness and long-term dynamics'. *Journal of Finance* **58**, 1933–1968.

- Brown, L. D. (1993a), 'Earnings forecasting research: Its implications for capital markets research'. *International Journal of Forecasting* 9, 295–320.
- Brown, L. D. (2001a), 'How important is past analyst forecast accuracy?'. Financial Analysts Journal 57, 44–49.
- Brown, L. D. (2001b), 'A temporal analysis of earnings surprises: Profits and losses'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **39**, 221–241.
- Brown, L. D. (2003), 'Small negative surprises: Frequency and consequence'. *International Journal of Forecasting* **19**(1), 149–159.
- Brown, L. D. and M. Caylor (2005), 'A temporal analysis of quarterly earnings thresholds: Propensities and valuation consequences'. *The Accounting Review* **80**(2), 423–440.
- Brown, L. D. and E. Mohd (2003), 'The predictive value of analyst characteristics'. *Journal of Accounting, Auditing and Finance* pp. 625–647.
- Brown, L. D., G. Richardson, and S. Schwager (1987), 'An information interpretation of financial analyst superiority in forecasting earnings'. Journal of Accounting Research 25(1), 49–67.
- Brown, L. D. and K. Sivakumar (2003), 'Comparing the value relevance of two operating income measures'. *Review of Accounting Studies* 8, 561–572.
- Brown, P. (1993b), 'Comments on Earnings forecasting research: Its implications for capital markets research'. *International Journal of Forecasting* **9**, 331–335.
- Brown, P., G. Foster, and E. Noreen (1985), 'Security analyst multiyear earnings forecasts and the capital market'. Studies in Accounting Research #21, American Accounting Association.
- Burgstahler, D. and M. Eames (2003), 'Earnings management to avoid losses and earnings decrease: Are analysts fooled?'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* **20**, 253–294.
- Burgstahler, D., J. Jiambalvo, and T.Shevlin (2002), 'Do stock prices fully reflect the implications of special items for future earnings?'. Journal of Accounting Research 40, 585–612.
- Bushee, B., D. Matsumoto, and G. Miller (2004), 'Managerial and investor responses to disclosure regulation: The case of Reg FD and conference calls'. *The Accounting Review* **79**(3), 617–643.

- Byard, D. and K. Shaw (2003), 'Corporate disclosure quality and properties of analysts' information environment'. *Journal of Accounting*, *Auditing and Finance* **18**, 355–378.
- Calegari, M. and N. Fargher (1997), 'Evidence that prices do not fully reflect the implications of current earnings for future earnings: An experimental markets approach'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* 14, 397–433.
- Chan, K. C., N. Jegadeesh, and J. Lakonishok (1996), 'Momentum strategies'. *Journal of Finance* **51**, 1681–1713.
- Chan, L., J. Karceski, and J. Lakonishok (2003), 'The level and persistence of growth rates'. *Journal of Finance* **58**, 643–684.
- Chandra, U., A. Procassini, and G. Waymire (1999), 'The use of trade association disclosures by investors and analysts: Evidence from the semiconductor industry'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* **16**, 643–670.
- Chaney, P. K., C. E. Hogan, and D. C. Jeter (1999), 'The effect of reporting restructuring charges on analysts' forecast revisions and errors'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 27, 261–284.
- Chen, Q., J. Francis, and W. Jiang (2005), 'Investor learning about analyst predictive ability'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **39**, 3–24.
- Chen, S. and J. Jiambalvo (2005), 'The relation between dispersion in analysts' forecasts and stock returns: Optimism versus drift'. Working Paper, University of Washington.
- Cheng, Q. (2005a), 'The role of analysts' forecasts in accounting-based valuation: A critical evaluation'. Review of Accounting Studies 10, 5–31.
- Cheng, Q. (2005b), 'What determines residual income?'. The Accounting Review 80(1), 58–85.
- Clarke, J., A. Khorana, A. Patel, and P. R. Rau (2006), 'Independents' day? Analyst behavior surrounding the Global Settlement'. Working Paper, Georgia Institute of Technology, Wake Forest University and Purdue University.
- Clarke, J. and A. Subramanian (2006), 'Dynamic forecasting behavior by analysts: Theory and evidence'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **80**, 81–113.

- Claus, J. and J. Thomas (2001), 'Equity premia as low as three percent? Evidence from analysts' earnings forecasts for domestic and international stock markets'. *Journal of Finance* **56**(5), 1629–1666.
- Clement, M. (1999). 'Analyst forecast accuracy: Do ability, resources, and portfolio complexity matter?' *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 27, 285–303.
- Clement, M. and S. Tse (2003). 'Do investors respond to analysts' forecast revisions as if forecast accuracy is all that matters?' *The Accounting Review* **78**, 227–249.
- Clement, M. and S. Tse (2005), 'Financial analyst characteristics and herding behavior in forecasting'. *Journal of Finance* **60**, 307–341.
- Cohen, D. A. and T. Z. Lys (2003), 'A note on analysts' earnings forecast error distribution'. Journal of Accounting and Economics 36, 147–164.
- Cooper, R., T. Day, and C. Lewis (2001), 'Following the leader: A study of individual analysts' earnings forecasts'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **61**, 383–416.
- Cowen, A., B. Groysberg, and P. Healy (2006). 'Which types of analyst firms are more optimistic?' *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **41**, 119–146.
- Daniel, K., D. Hirshleifer, and A. Subramanyam (1998), 'Investor psychology and security market under- and overreactions'. *Journal of Finance* **53**(6), 1839–1885.
- Das, S., C. Levine, and K. Sivaramakrishnan (1998), 'Earnings predictability and bias in analysts' earnings forecasts'. *The Accounting Review* **73**(2), 277–294.
- De Bondt, W. F. M. and R. Thaler (1990), 'Do security analysts over-react?'. American Economic Review 80, 52–57.
- De Long, J., A. Shleifer, L. Summers, and R. Waldman (1990), 'Noise trader risk in financial markets'. *Journal of Political Economy* **98**(4), 703–738.
- Dechow, P. M., A. P. Hutton, and R. G. Sloan (1999), 'An empirical assessment of the residual income valuation model'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **26**, 1–34.
- Dechow, P. M., A. P. Hutton, and R. G. Sloan (2000), 'The relation between analysts' forecasts of long-term earnings growth and stock

- price performance following equity offerings'. Contemporary Accounting Research 17, 1–32.
- Dechow, P. M. and R. G. Sloan (1997), 'Returns to contrarian investment strategies: Tests of naïve expectations hypotheses'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **43**, 3–27.
- DeFond, M. and M. Hung (2007), 'Investor protection and analysts' cash flow forecasts around the world'. *Review of Accounting Studies* 12, 377–419.
- Degeorge, F., J. Patel, and R. Zechauser (1999), 'Earnings management to exceed thresholds'. *Journal of Business* **72**(1), 1–34.
- Demirakos, E., N. Strong, and M. Walker (2004). 'What valuation models do analysts use?' *Accounting Horizons* **18**(4), 221–240.
- Desai, H. and P. C. Jain (1997), 'Long run common stock returns following stock splits and reverse splits'. *Journal of Business* **70**, 409–433.
- Diether, K. B., C. J. Malloy, and A. Scherbina (2002), 'Differences of opinion and the cross section of stock returns'. *Journal of Finance* 57, 2113–2141.
- Doukas, J. A., C. Kim, and C. Pantzalis (2002), 'A test of the errors-in-expectations explanation of the value/glamour stock returns performance: Evidence from analysts' forecasts'. *Journal of Finance* 57, 2143–2165.
- Dugar, A. and S. Nathan (1995), 'The effect of investment banking relationships on financial analysts' forecasts and investment recommendations'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* 11, 131–160.
- Duru, A. and D. Reeb (2002), 'International diversification and analysts' forecast accuracy and bias'. *The Accounting Review* 77, 415–433.
- Eames, M. and S. Glover (2003), 'Earnings predictability and the direction of analysts' forecast errors'. *The Accounting Review* **78**(3), 707–724.
- Eames, M., S. Glover, and J. Kennedy (2002), 'The association between trading recommendations and broker-analysts' earnings forecasts'. Journal of Accounting Research 40(1), 85–104.
- Eames, M., S. Glover, and J. Kennedy (2006), 'Stock recommendations as a source of bias in earnings forecasts'. *Behavioral Research in Accounting* **18**, 37–51.

- Easterwood, J. and S. Nutt (1999), 'Inefficiency in analysts' earnings forecasts: Systematic misreaction or systematic optimism?'. *Journal of Finance* **54**(5), 1777–1797.
- Easton, P. (2004), 'PE ratios, PEG ratios, and estimating the implied rate of return on equity capital'. The Accounting Review 79, 73–95.
- Easton, P. and S. Monahan (2005), 'An evaluation of accounting-based measures of expected returns'. *The Accounting Review* **80**(2), 501–538.
- Easton, P. and M. Zmijewski (1989), 'Cross-sectional variation in the stock market response to accounting earnings announcements'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **11**(2/3), 117–142.
- Eleswarapu, V., R. Thompson, and K. Venkataraman (2004), 'The impact of Regulation Fair Disclosure: Trading costs and information asymmetry'. *Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis* **39**(2), 209–225.
- Elgers, P., M. Lo, and R. Pfeiffer, Jr. (2003), 'Analysts vs. investors weightings of accruals in forecasting annual earnings'. *Journal of Accounting and Public Policy* **22**, 255–280.
- Elliott, J. A., D. R. Philbrick, and C. I. Weidman (1995), 'Evidence from archival data on the relation between security analysts' forecast errors and prior forecast revisions'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* 11, 919–938.
- Ely, K. and V. Mande (1996), 'The interdependent use of earnings and dividends in financial analysts' earnings forecasts'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* **13**, 435–456.
- Ertimur, Y., J. Livnat, and M. Martikainen (2003), 'Differential market reactions to revenue and earnings surprises'. *Review of Accounting Studies* (8), 185–211.
- Etteredge, M., P. Shane, and D. Smith (1995), 'Overstated quarterly earnings and analysts' earnings forecast revisions'. *Decision Sciences* **26**(6), 781–801.
- Fairfield, P., R. Sweeney, and T. Yohn (1996), 'Accounting classification and the predictive content of earnings'. The Accounting Review 71, 337–355.
- Fama, E. F. (1998), 'Market efficiency, long-term returns, and behavioral finance'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **49**, 283–306.

- Fischer, P. E. and P. C. Stocken (2001), 'Imperfect information and credible communication'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **39**(1), 119–134.
- Francis, J., D. Hanna, and D. Philbrick (1997), 'Management communications with securities analysts'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **24**(3), 363–394.
- Francis, J. and D. Philbrick (1993), 'Analysts' decisions as products of a multi-task environment'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **31**, 216–230.
- Francis, J. and L. Soffer (1997), 'The relative informativeness of analysts' stock recommendations and earnings forecast revisions'. Journal of Accounting Research 35, 193–211.
- Frankel, R. and C. Lee (1998), 'Accounting valuation, market expectation, and cross-sectional stock returns'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **25**, 283–320.
- Friesen, G. and P. Weller (2006), 'Quantifying cognitive biases in analyst earnings forecasts'. *Journal of Financial Markets* 9, 333–365.
- Gebhardt, W., C. Lee, and B. Swaminathan (2001), 'Toward an implied cost of capital'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **39**, 135–176.
- Gintschel, A. and S. Markov (2004), 'The effectiveness of Regulation FD'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **37**(3), 293–314.
- Givoly, D. and J. Lakonishok (1979), 'The information content of financial analysts' forecasts of earnings'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* 1(3), 165–185.
- Gleason, C. and C. Lee (2003), 'Analyst forecast revisions and market price discovery'. *The Accounting Review* **78**, 193–225.
- Gode, D. and P. Mohanram (2003), 'Inferring the cost of capital using the Ohlson-Juettner model'. Review of Accounting Studies 8, 399–431.
- Graham, J. (1999), 'Herding among investment newsletters: Theory and evidence'. *Journal of Finance* **54**, 237–268.
- Gu, Z. (2005a). 'Controlling for actual earnings: Does it mitigate or create spurious relations in forecast efficiency?' Working Paper, Carnegie Mellon University.

- Gu, Z. (2005b), 'Measuring the precision of analysts' private and common information: Generalization and an application'. Working Paper, Carnegie Mellon University.
- Gu, Z. and T. Chen (2004), 'Analysts' treatment of nonrecurring items in street earnings'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **38**, 129–170.
- Gu, Z. and J. Wu (2003), 'Earnings skewness and analyst forecast bias'. Journal of Accounting and Economics 35, 5–29.
- Gu, Z. and J. Xue (2005), 'Do analysts overreact to extreme good news in earnings?'. Working Paper, Carnegie Mellon University.
- Haw, I., K. Jung, and W. Ruland (1994), 'The accuracy of financial analysts' forecasts after mergers'. *Journal of Accounting, Auditing and Finance* **9**(3), 465–483.
- Hayes, R. (1998), 'The impact of trading commission incentives on analysts' stock coverage decisions and earnings forecasts'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **36**, 299–320.
- Hayes, R. and C. Levine (2000), 'An approach to adjusting analysts' consensus forecasts for selection bias'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* 17, 61–83.
- Healy, P. and A. Hutton (1999), 'Stock performance and intermediation changes surrounding sustained increases in disclosure'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* **16**(3), 485–520.
- Heflin, F., K. Subramanyam, and Y. Zhang (2003), 'Regulation FD and the financial information environment: Early evidence'. *The Accounting Review* **78**(1), 1–37.
- Hirst, E. and P. Hopkins (1998), 'Comprehensive income reporting and analysts' valuation judgments'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **36**, 47–75.
- Hirst, E., P. Hopkins, and J. Wahlen (2004), 'Fair values, income measurement, and bank analysts' risk and valuation judgments'. *The Accounting Review* **79**(2), 454–473.
- Hirst, E., L. Koonce, and P. Simko (1995), 'Investor reactions to financial analysts' research reports'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **33**, 335–351.
- Hong, H. and J. Kubik (2003), 'Analyzing the analysts: Career concerns and biased earnings forecasts'. *Journal of Finance* **58**, 313–351.

- Hong, H., J. Kubik, and D. Solomon (2000a), 'Security analysts' career concerns and herding of earnings forecasts'. Rand Journal of Economics 31, 121–144.
- Hong, H., T. Lim, and J. Stein (2000b), 'Bad news travels slowly: Size, analyst coverage, and the profitability of momentum strategies'. *Journal of Finance* **55**, 265–295.
- Hong, H. and J. Stein (1999), 'A unified theory of underreaction, momentum trading, and overreaction in asset markets'. *Journal of Finance* **54**, 2143–2184.
- Hope, O. (2003a), 'Accounting policy disclosures and analysts' forecasts'. Contemporary Accounting Research 20(2), 295–321.
- Hope, O. (2003b), 'Disclosure practices, enforcement of accounting standards, and analysts' forecast accuracy: An international study'. Journal of Accounting Research 41(2), 235–272.
- Hopkins, P. (1996), 'The effect of financial statement classification of hybrid financial instruments on financial analysts' stock price judgments'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **34**, 33–50.
- Hopkins, P., R. W. Houston, and M. F. Peters (2000), 'Purchase, pooling, and equity analysts' valuation judgments'. *Accounting Review* **75**(3), 257–281.
- Hunton, J. and R. McEwen (1997), 'An assessment of the relation between analysts' earnings forecast accuracy, motivational incentives and cognitive information search strategy'. *The Accounting Review* **72**(4), 497–515.
- Ikenberry, D. L. and S. Ramnath (2002), 'Underreaction to self-selected news events: The case of stock splits'. The Review of Financial Studies 15, 489–526.
- Ikenberry, D. L., G. Rankine, and E. K. Stice (1996), 'What do stock splits really signal?'. *Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis* 31, 357–375.
- Irani, A. and I. Karamanou (2003), 'Regulation Fair Disclosure, analyst following, and analyst forecast dispersion'. *Accounting Horizons* 17(1), 15–29.
- Irvine, P. (2004), 'Analysts' forecasts and brokerage-firm trading'. *The Accounting Review* **79**(1), 125–149.

- Ivkovic, Z. and N. Jegadeesh (2004), 'The timing and value of forecast and recommendation revisions'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **73**(3), 433–463.
- Jackson, A. (2005), 'Trade generation, reputation and sell-side analysts'. *Journal of Finance* **60**(2), 673–717.
- Jacob, J., T. Lys, and M. Neale (1999), 'Expertise in forecasting performance of security analysts'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **28**, 51–82.
- Jacob, J., S. Rock, and D. Weber (2008), 'Do non-investment bank analysts make better earnings forecasts?'. Journal of Accounting, Auditing and Finance 23(1), 23–61.
- Johnson, T. C. (2004), 'Forecast dispersion and the cross section of expected returns'. *Journal of Finance* **59**, 1957–1978.
- Jorion, P., Z. Liu, and C. Shi (2005), 'Informational effects of regulation FD: Evidence from rating agencies'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **76**(2), 309–330.
- Kadan, O., L. Madureira, R. Wang, and T. Zach (2008), 'Conflicts of interest and stock recommendations: The effects of the global settlement and related regulations'. Working Paper, Washington University.
- Kang, S., J. O'Brien, and K. Sivaramakrishnan (1994), 'Analysts' interim earnings forecasts: Evidence on the forecasting process'. Journal of Accounting Research 32, 103–112.
- Kasznik, R. and M. McNichols (2002), 'Does meeting earnings expectations matter? Evidence from analyst forecast revisions and share prices'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **40**(3), 727–759.
- Keane, M. and D. Runkle (1998), 'Are financial analysts' forecasts of corporate profits rational?'. *Journal of Political Economy* **106**(4), 768–805.
- Kim, O., S. C. Lim, and K. W. Shaw (2001), 'The inefficiency of the mean forecast as a summary forecast of earnings'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **39**, 329–336.
- Kolasinski, A. (2006), 'Is the Chinese wall too high? Investigating the costs of new restrictions on cooperation between analysts and investment bankers'. Working Paper, University of Washington.

- Kormendi, R. and R. Lipe (1987), 'Earnings innovations, earnings persistence, and stock returns'. *Journal of Business* **60**(3), 323–345.
- Kothari, S. P. (2001), 'Capital markets research in accounting'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **31**(1–3), 105–231.
- La Porta, R. (1996), 'Expectations and the cross-section of stock returns'. *Journal of Finance* **51**, 1715–1742.
- Lakonishok, J., A. Shleifer, and R. W. Vishny (1994), 'Contrarian investments, extrapolation, and risk'. *Journal of Finance* 49, 1541–1578.
- Lang, M., K. Lins, and D. Miller (2003), 'ADRs, analysts, and accuracy: Does cross listing in the United States improve a firm's information environment and increase market value?'. *Journal of Accounting Research* 41, 317–345.
- Lang, M. and R. Lundholm (1996), 'Corporate disclosure policy and analyst behavior'. *The Accounting Review* **71**, 467–492.
- Lev, B. and S. R. Thiagarajan (1993), 'Fundamental information analysis'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **31**, 190–215.
- Libby, R. and H. Tan (1999), 'Analysts' reactions to warnings of negative earnings surprises'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **37**(2), 415–435.
- Lim, T. (2001), 'Rationality and analysts' forecast bias'. *Journal of Finance* **56**(1), 369–385.
- Lin, H. and M. McNichols (1998), 'Underwriting relationships, analysts' earnings forecasts and investment recommendations'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **25**(1), 101–127.
- Liu, J. and J. Thomas (2000), 'Stock returns and accounting earnings'. Journal of Accounting Research 38, 71–101.
- Ljungqvist, A., F. Marston, and W. Wilhelm (2006), 'Competing for securities underwriting mandates: Banking relationships and analyst recommendations'. *Journal of Finance* **61**, 301–340.
- Loh, R. and G. Mian (2006). 'Do accurate earnings forecasts facilitate superior investment recommendations?' *Journal of Financial Economics* **80**, 455–483.
- Louis, H. (2004), 'Earnings management and the market performance of acquiring firms'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **74**, 121–148.

- Lynch, P. (1989), One Up on Wall Street. New York, NY: Simon and Schuster.
- Maines, L. (1996), 'An experimental examination of subjective forecast combination'. *International Journal of Forecasting* **12**, 223–233.
- Maines, L. and J. Hand (1996), 'Individuals' perceptions and misperceptions of time series properties of quarterly earnings'. *The Accounting Review* **71**(3), 317–336.
- Maines, L., L. McDaniel, and M. Harris (1997), 'Implications of proposed segment reporting standards for financial analysts' investment judgments'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **35**, 1–24.
- Malloy, C. (2005), 'The geography of equity analysis'. *Journal of Finance* **60**(2), 719–755.
- Matsumoto, D. (2002), 'Management's incentives to avoid negative earnings surprises'. *The Accounting Review* 77, 483–514.
- Matsunaga, S. and C. Park (2001), 'The effect of missing a quarterly earnings benchmark on the CEO's annual bonus'. *The Accounting Review* **76**(3), 313–332.
- McNichols, M. and P. O'Brien (1997), 'Self-selection and analyst coverage'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **35**, 167–199.
- Mehran, H. and R. M. Stulz (2007), 'The economics of conflicts of interest in financial institutions'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **85**, 267–296.
- Melendrez, K., W. Schwartz, and M. Trombley (2005). 'How does the market value accrual and cash flow surprises?' Working Paper, Arizona State University.
- Mendenhall, R. (1991), 'Evidence of possible underweighting of earnings-related information'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **29**, 170–180.
- Michaely, R. and K. Womack (1999), 'Conflict of interest and the credibility of underwriter analyst recommendations'. *Review of Financial Studies* **12**(4), 653–686.
- Mikhail, M. B., B. R. Walther, and R. H. Willis (1997). 'Do security analysts improve their performance with experience?' *Journal of Accounting Research* **35**, 131–157.

- Mikhail, M. B., B. R. Walther, and R. H. Willis (1999). 'Does forecast accuracy matter to security analysts?' *The Accounting Review* **74**, 185–200.
- Mikhail, M. B., B. R. Walther, and R. H. Willis (2003), 'The effect of experience on security analyst underreaction'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **35**, 101–116.
- Mikhail, M. B., B. R. Walther, and R. H. Willis (2004). 'Do security analysts exhibit persistent differences in stock picking ability?' *Journal of Financial Economics* **74**, 67–91.
- Mozes, H. (2003), 'Accuracy, usefulness and the evaluation of analysts' forecasts'. *International Journal of Forecasting* **19**, 417–434.
- O'Brien, P. (1988), 'Analysts' forecasts as earnings expectations'. Journal of Accounting and Economics 10, 159–193.
- O'Hanlon, J. (1993), 'Commentary on Earnings forecasting research: Its implications for capital markets research, by L. Brown'. *International Journal of Forecasting* 9, 321–323.
- Ohlson, J. (1995), 'Earnings, book values, and dividends in equity valuation'. Contemporary Accounting Research 11(2), 661–687.
- Park, C. and E. Stice (2000), 'Analyst forecasting ability and stock price reaction to forecast revisions'. *Review of Accounting Studies* 5, 259–272.
- Payne, J. L. and W. B. Thomas (2003), 'The implications of using stock-split adjusted I/B/E/S data in empirical research'. *The Accounting Review* **78**(4), 1049–1067.
- Philbrick, D. and W. Ricks (1991), 'Using value line and I/B/E/S forecasts in accounting research'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **29**, 397–417.
- Purnanandam, A. K. and B. Swaminathan (2004), 'Are IPOs really underpriced?'. *The Review of Financial Studies* 17, 811–848.
- Raedy, J., P. Shane, and Y. Yang (2006), 'Horizon-dependent underreaction in financial analysts' earnings forecasts'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* 23, 291–322.
- Rajan, R. and H. Servaes (1997), 'Analyst following of initial public offerings'. *Journal of Finance* **52**, 507–529.

- Ramnath, S. (2002), 'Investor and analyst reactions to earnings announcements of related firms: An empirical analysis'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **40**, 1351–1376.
- Ramnath, S., S. Rock, and P. Shane (2005), 'Value line and I/B/E/S earnings forecasts'. *International Journal of Forecasting* **21**, 185–198.
- Ramnath, S., S. Rock, and P. Shane (2008), 'The financial analyst fore-casting literature: A taxonomy with suggestions for further research'. *International Journal of Forecasting* **24**, 34–75.
- Richardson, S., S. Teoh, and P. Wysocki (2004), 'The walk-down to beatable analyst forecasts: The role of equity issuance and insider trading incentives'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* **21**(4), 885–924.
- Rogers, R. and J. Grant (1997), 'Content analysis of information cited in reports of sell-side financial analysts'. *Journal of Financial Statement Analysis* **3**(1), 17–30.
- Schipper, K. (1991), 'Analysts' forecasts'. Accounting Horizons 5(4), 105–131.
- Sedor, L. (2002), 'An explanation for unintentional optimism in analysts' earnings forecasts'. *The Accounting Review* **77**(4), 731–753.
- Shane, P. and P. Brous (2001), 'Investor and (Value Line) analyst underreaction to information about future earnings: The corrective role of non-earnings-surprise information'. *Journal of Accounting Research* 39, 387–404.
- Shane, P., N. Soderstrom, and S. Yoon (2001), 'Earnings and price discover in the Post-Reg FD information environment: A preliminary analysis'. Working Paper, University of Colorado.
- Shane, P. and T. Stock (2006), 'Security analyst and market anticipation of tax-motivated income shifting'. *The Accounting Review* **21**, 185–198.
- Sinha, P., L. D. Brown, and S. Das (1997), 'A re-examination of financial analysts' differential earnings forecast accuracy'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* 14, 1–42.
- Skinner, D. and R. Sloan (2002), 'Earnings surprises, growth expectations, and stock returns or don't let an earnings torpedo sink your portfolio'. *Review of Accounting Studies* **7**(3), 289–312.

- Slezak, S. (2003), 'On the impossibility of weak-form efficient markets'. Journal of Financial and Quantitative Analysis 38(3), 523–554.
- Soffer, L., S. R. Thiagarajan, and B. Walther (2000), 'Earnings preannouncement strategies'. *Review of Accounting Studies* **5**(1), 5–26.
- Stickel, S. (1989), 'The timing of and incentives for annual earnings forecasts near interim earnings announcements'. *Journal of Accounting and Economics* **11**(2–3), 275–292.
- Stickel, S. (1991), 'Common stock returns surrounding earnings forecasts revisions: More puzzling evidence'. *The Accounting Review* **66**(2), 402–416.
- Stickel, S. (1992), 'Reputation and performance among security analysts'. *Journal of Finance* **47**(5), 1811–1836.
- Tan, H., R. Libby, and J. Hunton (2002), 'Analysts' reactions to earnings preannouncement strategies'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **40**(1), 223–246.
- Teoh, S. H. and T. J. Wong (2002), 'Why new issues and high-accrual firms underperform: The role of analysts' credulity'. *The Review of Financial Studies* **15**, 869–900.
- Thomas, J. (1993), 'Comments on 'Earnings forecasting research: Its implications for capital markets research, by L. Brown'. *International Journal of Forecasting* 9, 325–330.
- Trueman, B. (1990), 'On the incentives for security analysts to revise their earnings forecasts'. *Contemporary Accounting Research* **7**(1), 203–222.
- Trueman, B. (1994), 'Analyst forecast and herding behavior'. Review of Financial Studies 7, 97–124.
- Walther, B. (1997), 'Investor sophistication and market earnings expectations'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **35**, 157–179.
- Welch, I. (2000), 'Herding among security analysts'. *Journal of Financial Economics* **58**, 369–386.
- Wiedman, C. (1996), 'The relevance of characteristics of the information environment in the selection of a proxy for the Market's expectations for earnings: An extension of Brown, Richardson, and Schwanger [1987]'. *Journal of Accounting Research* **34**(2), 313–324.

- Williams, P. (1996), 'The relation between a prior earnings forecast by management and analyst response to a current management forecast'. The Accounting Review 71, 103–113.
- Womack, K. (1996), 'Do brokerage analysts' recommendations have investment value?'. *Journal of Finance* **51**, 137–167.
- Ziebart, D. (1990), 'The association between consensus of beliefs and trading activity surrounding earnings announcements'. The Accounting Review 65, 477–488.
- Zmijewski, M. (1993), 'Comments on 'Earnings forecasting research: Its implications for capital markets research' by L. Brown'. *International Journal of Forecasting* **9**, 337–342.