Revisiting the Foundations of Organizational Distrust
Revisiting the Foundations of Organizational Distrust

Shiau-Ling Guo
Krannert School of Management, Purdue University, USA

Fabrice Lumineau
Krannert School of Management, Purdue University, USA

Roy J. Lewicki
Fisher College of Business, The Ohio State University, USA
Foundations and Trends® in Management

Published, sold and distributed by:
now Publishers Inc.
PO Box 1024
Hanover, MA 02339
United States
Tel. +1-781-985-4510
www.nowpublishers.com
sales@nowpublishers.com

Outside North America:
now Publishers Inc.
PO Box 179
2600 AD Delft
The Netherlands
Tel. +31-6-51115274

The preferred citation for this publication is

© 2017 S.-L. Guo and F. Lumineau and R. J. Lewicki

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

Photocopying. In the USA: This journal is registered at the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, or the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by now Publishers Inc for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC). The ‘services’ for users can be found on the internet at: www.copyright.com

For those organizations that have been granted a photocopy license, a separate system of payment has been arranged. Authorization does not extend to other kinds of copying, such as that for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. In the rest of the world: Permission to photocopy must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to now Publishers Inc., PO Box 1024, Hanover, MA 02339, USA; Tel. +1 781 871 0245; www.nowpublishers.com; sales@nowpublishers.com

now Publishers Inc. has an exclusive license to publish this material worldwide. Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright license holder. Please apply to now Publishers, PO Box 179, 2600 AD Delft, The Netherlands, www.nowpublishers.com; e-mail: sales@nowpublishers.com

Full text available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1561/3400000001
Editorial Scope

Topics

Foundations and Trends® in Management publishes survey and tutorial articles in the following topics:

- International Business
- Organizational Behavior
- Strategic Management

Information for Librarians

Foundations and Trends® in Management, 2017, Volume 1, 4 issues. ISSN paper version 2475-6946. ISSN online version 2475-6954. Also available as a combined paper and online subscription.
# Contents

1. Introduction

2. Extant Research on Distrust in Organizational Settings
   - 2.1 Forms of Organizational Distrust
   - 2.2 Antecedents of Organizational Distrust
   - 2.3 Consequences of Organizational Distrust
   - 2.4 Contingencies of Organizational Distrust
   - 2.5 Temporal Factors

3. Conceptual Relationships between Trust and Distrust
   - 3.1 Managerial and Theoretical Implications of the Relationship between Trust and Distrust
   - 3.2 Prevailing Assumption in Extant Work: Whether Trust and Distrust are Opposite Phenomena
   - 3.3 Key Assumptions for the Future Study of Trust and Distrust

4. The Relationship between Trust and Distrust: Empirical Evidence and Research Opportunities
   - 4.1 Approaches to Address Complexity or Uncertainty
   - 4.2 Sources of Trust and Distrust
   - 4.3 Dimensions of Distrustworthiness and Trustworthiness

Full text available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1561/3400000001
4.4 Pervasiveness of Expectation Violation and the Types of Remedy Used .................................................. 41
4.5 Integrating Distrust in Relationship Repair Research . . . 43
4.6 Alternative Approaches and Manifestations for Relationship Repair ..................................................... 44
4.7 Double-Edged Role of Distrust ................................................. 47
4.8 Optimal Distrust .................................................................... 48
4.9 Compensation between Trust and Distrust ......................... 50

5 Other Research Avenues Connecting Distrust to Strategic Management 54
  5.1 Organizational Ambivalence .............................................. 54
  5.2 Interplay of Formal Organizational Governance ............... 56
  5.3 Integration of Organizational Ambivalence and Formal/Informal Governance ........................................... 57

6 Specific Empirical Challenges in Distrust Studies 59
  6.1 Disposition of Distrust ...................................................... 59
  6.2 Subjective Facets of Distrustworthiness .......................... 63
  6.3 Diverse Perspectives on the Construct of Distrust ............ 64
  6.4 Specific Problems of Survey and Experiment Methods .... 65

7 Conclusion 68

References 70
Revisiting the Foundations of Organizational Distrust

Shiau-Ling Guo¹, Fabrice Lumineau² and Roy J. Lewicki³∗

¹Krannert School of Management, Purdue University
²Krannert School of Management, Purdue University; Lumineau@purdue.edu
³Fisher College of Business, The Ohio State University

ABSTRACT

Parallel to the very large scholarly interest in trust, scholars in management and related disciplines have made the case for the importance of distrust as a related but distinct construct. This paper critically assesses current literature on distrust in organizational settings. We first take stock of the extant research on organizational distrust and suggest an integrative framework.

Second, to underpin research on organizational distrust, we examine the different scholarly perspectives on the conceptual relationship between trust and distrust. In turn, we discuss key issues to position research on trust and distrust. Third, we highlight empirical evidence on the role of distrust as opposed to that of trust. We specifically discuss alternative approaches and implications about how

*We gratefully acknowledge the helpful comments on earlier versions of this paper provided by Reinhard Bachmann, Anna Brattström, Goran Calic, Valérie Duplat, Darcy Fudge-Kamal, Nicole Gillespie, Frens Kroeger, Mark Saunders, Oliver Schilke, Rosalind Searle, David Schoorman, Sim Sitkin, Antoinette Weibel, and Aks Zaheer. Previous versions of this paper were presented at the Center for Trust Research at the University of Surrey, the Skema Business School, and the AOM Conference 2014. All errors are ours.

distrust and trust can be empirically distinguished. Fourth, we make suggestions to integrate distrust research into relationship repair literature. Fifth, we summarize our review and point to specific areas for new theoretical and empirical research on distrust, particularly at the organizational level. Finally, we discuss specific empirical challenges in this growing literature. Based on our systematic discussion of the organizational distrust literature, we believe that we have opened up prospective avenues to advance distrust research in strategic management.
Parallel to the very large scholarly interest in trust in an organizational context, researchers from a variety of disciplines—organization theory (e.g., Sitkin and Roth, 1993), marketing (e.g., Cho, 2006), international business (e.g., MacDuffie, 2011), strategy (e.g., Lumineau, 2017), information systems (e.g., Dimoka, 2010), and psychology (e.g., Kramer, 1999)—have started making significant progress in grasping distrust. While efforts are regularly being made to synthesize the works on trust (see Fulmer and Gelfand, 2012; Kramer and Lewicki, 2010; or Lewicki et al., 2006 for recent reviews), the evidence accumulating on organizational distrust lacks coherence.

While social scientists have regarded trust as a critical element in social exchange (Blau, 1964), distrust is also at the heart of social relationships. Distrust has been linked to a large set of organizational issues ranging from intergroup behaviors (Insko and Schopler, 1997), revenge (Bies and Tripp, 1996), transaction costs (Levi et al., 2004), cognitive processes (Fein, 1996; Hilton et al., 1993), organizational control (Walgenbach, 2001), purchasing decisions (Cho, 2006), or interorganizational contracting (Connelly et al., 2012a; Lumineau, 2017). Fifteen years ago, Kramer (1999) and Lewicki et al. (1998) pointed out the
importance of distrust in organizations and called for a more system-
atic study of this construct. However, Kramer’s (1999) study mostly
discussed the empirical antecedents and consequences of distrust and
did not explicitly indicate how the extant research validated the neces-
sity of additional distrust studies compared to trust studies. Lewicki
et al. (1998), on the other hand, focused on providing evidence of the
coexistence of trust and distrust but only shed some light on the con-
ceptual relationship between trust and distrust, the coexistence of these
two constructs, and their implications for strategic management. The
current paper is different from these prior studies in that it does not
avoid a comparison of distrust to trust. Rather, we systematically dis-
cuss the theoretical perspectives on the relationship between distrust
and trust, highlight the potential research opportunities and challenges
pertinent to distrust studies, and draw implications of distrust research
for strategic management.

As illustrated in Figure 1.1, the literature on distrust has grown
substantially since the beginning of the 1960s.\footnote{Although distrust has been discussed by philosophers for centuries (e.g. “Both
oligarch and tyrant mistrust the people, and therefore deprive them of their arms”—Aristotle; “Objection, evasion, joyous distrust, and love of irony are signs of health;
everything absolute belongs to pathology”—Friedrich Nietzsche), we traced back the
first systematic discussion of distrust in social sciences at the beginning of the 1960s.}
One initial observation
is that the extant research uses many different definitions and perspec-
tives on distrust, and this diversity exacerbates the fragmentation of the
literature. The variety of perspectives on distrust only re-emphasizes
the necessity of gaining a better understanding of how distrust links
to and distinguishes itself from trust before exploring the prospect and
challenges of distrust research, particularly for scholars in strategic man-
agement. More specifically, it is crucial to draw attention to the novel
insights that distrust studies may bring about for strategic management
and organizational theory scholars. Hence, we organize our analysis into
six parts: (a) discussing extant research on distrust in organizational
settings; (b) examining various theoretical perspectives on the relation-
ship between trust and distrust; (c) illustrating the extant empirical
evidence of the relationship between trust and distrust; (d) considering
the potential role of distrust in relationship repair; (e) pointing out
**Figure 1.1:** Growth in Studies on Distrust in Organizational Settings, 1960-2013.

Note: This figure is based on a computerized search of the Web of Knowledge, ProQuest, and Ebsco databases. We conducted our search with the primary keyword *distrust*, either as the topic of the study, or in its abstract, or in the whole document. Following the approach of prior reviews (e.g., Fulmer and Gelfand, 2012), we first focused on the 15 major management journals (*Academy of Management Journal, Academy of Management Review, Administrative Science Quarterly, Business and Society, Business Ethics Quarterly, Journal of Applied Psychology, Journal of Business Ethics, Journal of Management, Journal of Management Studies, Journal of Organizational Behavior, Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, Organization Science, Organization Studies, Personnel Psychology, and Strategic Management Journal*). This left us with a total of 68 papers.

We then undertook complementary manual searches in the 15 major journals, in the Social Sciences Citation Index using the seminal articles, and on the websites of contributors to look for other relevant papers and books (see Aguinis and Glavas, 2012; Fulmer and Gelfand, 2012 for a similar approach). Through this manual search process, we identified several relevant books (e.g., Fox, 1974; Luhmann, 1979) and papers (e.g., Bies and Tripp, 1996; Worchel, 1979) that were not in our initial list. The review underpinning our arguments, therefore, has a broad approach by including both quantitative and qualitative studies, both theoretical and empirical works published in target journals, and relevant seminal articles outside the target journals as well as representative books. These papers and books were then read and coded by two independent coders and any differences were resolved through discussion.
specific research avenues in strategy areas; and (f) highlighting empirical challenges of studying distrust in organizational settings. Based on our examination of existing research on distrust in organizational settings in the first section, we extend our discussion to various theoretical perspectives and empirical evidence of the relationship between trust and distrust in the following sections. We also suggest specific promising research opportunities and challenges of distrust studies in the last three sections. As distrust spans many different research areas, we believe that our study is likely to interest scholars in management as well as in the sociology of organizations and organizational psychology.


References


References


References


