Full text available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1561/070000014

Economics of Crime

Economics of Crime

Erling Eide

Faculty of Law, University of Oslo Box 6706 Oslo 0130, Norway

Paul H. Rubin

Department of Economics, Emory University Atlanta GA 30322, USA

Joanna M. Shepherd

School of Law Emory University Atlanta GA 30322, USA



the essence of knowledge

Boston – Delft

Foundations and Trends^(R) in Microeconomics

Published, sold and distributed by: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 1024 Hanover, MA 02339 USA Tel. +1-781-985-4510 www.nowpublishers.com sales@nowpublishers.com

Outside North America: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 179 2600 AD Delft The Netherlands Tel. +31-6-51115274

Library of Congress Control Number: 2006935710

The preferred citation for this publication is E. Eide, P. H. Rubin and J. M. Shepherd, Economics of Crime, Foundations and Trends[®] in Microeconomics, vol 2, no 3, pp 205–279, 2006

Printed on acid-free paper

ISBN: 1-933019-48-4 © 2006 E. Eide, P. H. Rubin and J. M. Shepherd

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

Photocopying. In the USA: This journal is registered at the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, or the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by now Publishers Inc for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC). The 'services' for users can be found on the internet at: www.copyright.com

For those organizations that have been granted a photocopy license, a separate system of payment has been arranged. Authorization does not extend to other kinds of copying, such as that for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. In the rest of the world: Permission to photocopy must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to now Publishers Inc., PO Box 1024, Hanover, MA 02339, USA; Tel. +1 781 871 0245; www.nowpublishers.com; sales@nowpublishers.com

now Publishers Inc. has an exclusive license to publish this material worldwide. Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright license holder. Please apply to now Publishers, PO Box 179, 2600 AD Delft, The Netherlands, www.nowpublishers.com; e-mail: sales@nowpublishers.com

Foundations and Trends[®] in Microeconomics Volume 2 Issue 3, 2006

Editorial Board

Editor-in-Chief:

W. Kip Viscusi University Distinguished Professor of Law, Economics, and Management Vanderbilt University 131 21st Avenue South Nashville, TN 37203-1181

Editors

Richard Carson, UC San Diego (environmental economics)
Joseph Harrington, Johns Hopkins University (industrial organization)
Tom Kniesner, Syracuse University (labor economics)
Mark V. Pauly, University of Pennsylvania (health economics)
Thomas Nechyba, Duke University (public economics)
Peter Zweifel, University of Zurich (insurance economics)

Editorial Scope

Foundations and Trends[®] in Microeconomics will publish survey and tutorial articles in the following topics:

- Environmental Economics
 - Contingent Valuation
 - Environmental Health Risks
 - Climate Change
 - Endangered Species
 - Market-based Policy Instruments
- Health Economics
 - Moral Hazard
 - Medical Care Markets
 - Medical Malpractice
 - Insurance economics
- Industrial Organization
 - Theory of the Firm
 - Regulatory Economics
 - Market Structure
 - Auctions
 - Monopolies and Antitrust
 - Transaction Cost Economics

- Labor Economics
 - Labor Supply
 - Labor Demand
 - Labor Market Institutions
 - Search Theory
 - Wage Structure
 - Income Distribution
 - Race and Gender
- Law and Economics
 - Models of Litigation
 - Crime
 - Torts, Contracts and Property
 - Constitutional Law
- Public Economics
 - Public Goods
 - Environmental Taxation
 - Social Insurance
 - Public Finance
 - International Taxation

Information for Librarians

Foundations and Trends[®] in Microeconomics, 2006, Volume 2, 6 issues. ISSN paper version 1547-9846. ISSN online version 1547-9854. Also available as a combined paper and online subscription.

Foundations and Trends[®] in Microeconomics Vol. 2, No 3 (2006) 205–279 © 2006 E. Eide, P. H. Rubin and J. M. Shepherd DOI: 10.1561/0700000014



Economics of Crime

Erling Eide¹, Paul H. Rubin² and Joanna M. Shepherd³

¹ Faculty of Law, University of Oslo, Oslo 0130, Norway

² Department of Economics, Emory University, Atlanta GA 30322, USA

³ School of Law Emory University, Atlanta GA 30322, USA

Abstract

This paper starts with a review the economics of criminal behavior. Then, the authors discuss the theory of public enforcement. The economic analysis of criminal behavior and criminal law has been a hugely successful enterprise. As an academic enterprise, it has achieved the goal of research—it has generated a large and growing literature. More important than academic success, however, has been the influence of this branch of learning on actual practice. The understanding of deterrence effects and rational responses by criminals has substantially changed the purpose and functioning of the criminal justice system.

Contents

1]	Introduction	1
2 '	The Economics of Criminal Behavior	3
2.1	The Basic Model	3
2.2	Extensions of the Basic Model	5
2.3	The Benefits and Costs of Crime	10
2.4	Are Criminals Really Rational?	12
2.5	Empirical Studies	14
2.6	Methodologic Problems and Criticism	28
2.7	The Case of Capital Punishment	34
2.8	Guns and Abortions	41
3	43	
3.1	Probability and Severity	44
3.2	Fines and Imprisonment	46
3.3	Risk Preferences	46
3.4	Imperfect Information	48
3.5	Targeted and General Enforcement	50
3.6	Repeat Offenders	51
3.7	Enforcement Errors	53
3.8	Reductions in Enforcement Costs	54
3.9	Incentives of Enforcers	54

4 Conclusion	57
Acknowledgements	59
References	61



During the past 40 years, beginning with the work of Becker (1968) economists have invaded the field of criminology, using their allembracing model of individual rational behavior. In this model, a criminal act is preferred and chosen if the total payoff, including the expected cost of sanctions and other costs, is higher than that of legal alternatives. The theory of deterrence thus obtained is regarded as a special case of the general theory of rational behavior under uncertainty. Assuming that individual preferences are constant, the model can be used to predict how changes in the probability and severity of sanctions and in various socio-economic factors may affect the amount of crime. Even if most of those who violate certain laws differ systematically from those who abide by the same laws, the former, like the latter, do respond to incentives (i.e., to sanctions and refinement have been carried out on the basis of this theory.

Whereas the general preventive effects of sanctions for a long time have occupied a main position in penal legislation and sentencing policy, such effects were almost totally neglected in criminology and modern sociology until the late 1960s. Criminologists have been more

2 Introduction

interested in rehabilitation and treatment, and many are still reluctant to accept studies of deterrence in general and models of criminal behavior based on rational choice in particular. However, scholars who are reluctant to accept the assumption of rational choice still find interest in the rather rigorous empirical studies in the economics of crime literature (Andenæs, 1975), and sociologists have in recent years been inspired to carry out similar research.

Models of criminal behavior in which a person is assumed to act rationally on the basis of costs and benefits of legal and illegal opportunities are presented. Many of these models are similar to models of portfolio choice or of supply of labor. The empirical studies that are surveyed use various types of regression analyses and employ data from states and police regions down to campuses and individuals. Most studies corroborate the hypothesis that the probability of punishment, and to a lesser degree also the severity of punishment, has a deterrent effect on crime. The effects of various economic factors are less clear, although unemployment seems to increase crime. Methodologic problems relating to the assumption of rationality, to statistic identification of equations, to measurement errors, and to operationalization of theoretic variables are discussed.

In what follows, we first discuss the economics of criminal behavior. We next discuss the theory of public enforcement. We omit some topics. In particular, we do not discuss corporate crime, organized crime, and criminal procedure. Each of these is worthy of a separate essay; here we discuss the basic model of criminal behavior and of law enforcement.

- Aasness, J., E. Eide, and T. Skjerpen (1994), 'Criminometrics, latent variables, panel data, and different types of crime'. *Statistics Norway* 124. Discussion paper.
- Albert, C. J. (1999), 'Challenging deterrence: New insights on capital punishment derived from panel data'. University of Pittsburgh Law Review 60, 321–371.
- Allingham, M. G. and A. Sandmo (1972), 'Income tax evasion: A theoretical analysis'. Journal of Public Economics 1, 323–338.
- Andenæs, J. (1975), 'General prevention revisited: Research and policy implications'. Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology 66, 338–365.
- Anderson, D. A. (2002), 'The deterrence hypothesis and picking pockets at the pickpockets hanging'. American Law and Economics Review 4, 295–313.
- Andreoni, J. (1991), 'Reasonable doubt and the optimal magnitude of fines: Should the penalty fit the crime?'. RAND Journal of Economics 22, 385–395.
- Athens, L. H. (1980), Violent Criminal Acts and Actors: A Symbolic Interactionist Study. Boston: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

- Avio, K. L. and C. S. Clark (1978), 'The supply of property offences in Ontario: Evidence on the deterrent effect of punishment'. *Canadian Journal of Economics* 11, 1–19.
- Ayres, I. and J. J. Donohue (1999), 'Nondiscretionary concealed weapons laws: A case study of statistics, standards of proof, and public policies'. American Law and Economics Review 1(1 and 2), 436–470.
- Bailey, W. C. (1998), 'Deterrence, brutalization, and the death penalty: Another examination of Oklahoma's return to capital punishment'. *Criminology* 36, 711–733.
- Baldry, J. C. (1974), 'Positive economic analysis of criminal behaviour'. In: A. J. Culyer (ed.): *Economic Policies and Social Goals*. pp. 171–198, Martin Robertson.
- Bebchuk, L. A. and L. Kaplow (1992), 'Optimal sanctions when individuals are imperfectly informed about the probability of apprehension'. *Journal of Legal Studies* 21, 365–370.
- Beccaria, C. (1995). In: R. Bellamy (ed.): On Crimes and Punishments, and Other Writings (1767). Cambridge University Press.
- Becker, G. S. (1968), 'Crime and punishment: An economic approach'. Journal of Political Economy 76, 169–217.
- Becker, G. S. (1976), The Economic Approach to Human Behavior. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Becker, G. S. and G. J. Stigler (1974), 'Law enforcement, malfeasance, and compensation of enforcers'. *Journal of Legal Studies* **3**, 1–18.
- Benson, B. L. (1998), To Serve and Protect: Privatization and Community in Criminal Justice. New York: New York University Press.
- Bentham, J. (1789), 'An introduction to the principles of morals and legislation'. In: *The Utilitarians*. Garden City NY, Anchor Books.
- Bentham, J. (1843), 'Principles of Penal Law'. In: J. Bowring (ed.): The Works of Jeremy Bentham, Vol. 1 of 1962. Russell & Russell.
- Berk, R. (2005), 'New claims about executions and general deterrence: Déjà Vu all over again?'. Journal of Empirical Legal Studies 2, 303–330.
- Beyleveld, D. (1980), A Bibliography on General Deterrence Research. Westmead UK: Saxon House.

Full text available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1561/0700000014

- Block, M. K. and J. M. Heineke (1975), 'A labor theoretic analysis of the criminal choice'. American Economic Review 65, 314–325.
- Block, M. K. and R. C. Lind (1975), 'An economic analysis of crimes punishable by imprisonment'. *Journal of Legal Studies* 4, 479–492.
- Block, M. K. and J. G. Sidak (1980), 'The cost of antitrust deterrence: Why not hang a price fixer now and then?'. *Georgetown Law Journal* 68, 1131–1139.
- Blumstein, A., J. Cohen, and D. S. Nagin (eds.) (1978), Deterrence and Incapacitation: Estimating the Effects of Criminal Sanctions on Crime Rates. Washington, DC: National Academy of Sciences.
- Blumstein, A. and D. S. Nagin (1977), 'The deterrent effect of legal sanctions on draft evasion'. *Stanford Law Review* **29**, 241–276.
- Bowles, R. (2000), 'Corruption'. In: B. Bouckaert and G. D. Geest (eds.): *Encyclopedia of Law and Economics*. Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited, pp. 460–491.
- Bowles, R. and N. Garoupa (1997), 'Casual police corruption and the economics of crime'. International Review of Law and Economics 17, 75–87.
- Brier, S. S. and S. E. Fienberg (1980), 'Recent econometric modeling of crime and punishment: Support for the deterrence hypothesis'. *Evaluation Review* 4, 147–191.
- Britt, C. L. (2001), 'Testing theory and the analysis of time series data'. Journal of Quantitative Criminology 17, 343–357.
- Brown, W. W. and M. O. Reynolds (1973), 'Crime and punishment: Risk implications'. *Journal of Economic Theory* 6, 508–514.
- Brumm, H. J. and D. O. Cloninger (1996), 'Perceived risk of punishment and the commission of homicides: A covariance structure analysis'. *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization* **31**, 1–11.
- Buck, A. J., M. Gross, S. Hakim, and J. Weinblatt (1983), 'The deterrence hypothesis revisited'. *Regional Science and Urban Economics* 13, 471–486.
- Burnovski, M. and Z. Safra (1994), 'Deterrence effects of sequential punishment policies: Should repeat offenders be more severely punished?'. International Journal of Industrial Organization 11, 341– 350.

- Cameron, S. (1987), 'Substitution between offence categories in the supply of property crime: Some new evidence'. *International Journal* of Social Economics 14, 48–60.
- Cameron, S. (1988), 'The economics of crime deterrence: A survey of theory and evidence'. Kyklos 41, 301–323.
- Cantor, D. and K. C. Land (1985), 'Unemployment and crime rates in the Post-World War II United States: A theoretical and empirical analysis'. American Sociological Review 50, 317–323.
- Cantor, D. and K. C. Land (2001), 'Unemployment and crime rate fluctuations: A comment on Greenberg'. Journal of Quantitative Criminology 17, 329–341.
- Carmichael, F. and R. Ward (2001), 'Male unemployment and crime in England and Wales'. *Economics Letters* 73, 111–115.
- Caroll, J. and F. Weaver (1986), "Shoplifters' perceptions of crime opportunities: A process-tracing study'. In: D. B. Cornish and R. V. Clarke (eds.): *The Reasoning Criminal*. pp. 18–38, Springer-Verlag.
- Carr-Hill, R. A. and N. H. Stern (1973), 'An econometric model of the supply and control of recorded offences in England and Wales'. *Journal of Public Economics* 2, 289–318.
- Carr-Hill, R. A. and N. H. Stern (1979), Crime, The Police and Criminal Statistics. Academic Press, London.
- Chapman, J. I. (1976), 'An economic model of crime and police: Some empirical results'. Journal of Research in Crime and Delinquency 13, 48–63.
- Chiricos, T. G. (1987), 'Rates of crime and unemployment: An analysis of aggregate research evidence'. *Social Problems* **34**, 187–212.
- Chisholm, J. and C. Choe (2005), 'Income variables and the measures of gains from crime'. Oxford Economic Papers 57, 112–119.
- Chu, C. Y. C., S. Hu, and T. Huang (2000), 'Punishing repeat offenders more severely'. *International Review of Law and Economics* **20**, 127–140.
- Chu, C. Y. C. and N. Jiang (1993), 'Are fines more efficient than imprisonment?'. Journal of Public Economics 51, 391–413.
- Cloninger, D. O. and R. Marchesini (2001), 'Execution and deterrence: A quasi-controlled group experiment'. Applied Economics 35, 569–576.

- Cloninger, D. O. and L. Sartorius (1979), 'Crime rates, clearance rates and enforcement effort: The case of Houston, Texas'. American Journal of Economics and Sociology 4, 389–402.
- Clotfelter, C. T. (1983), 'Tax evasion and tax rates: An analysis of individual returns'. Review of Economics and Statistics 65, 363–373.
- Cochran, J. K., M. B. Chamlin, and M. Seth (1994), 'Deterrence or brutalization? An impact assessment of Oklahoma's return to capital punishment'. *Criminolog* **32**, 107–134.
- Cohen, L. E., M. Felson, and K. Land (1980), 'Property crime rates in the United States: A macrodynamic analysis 1947–1977 with Ex Ante Forecasts for the Mid-1980s'. American Journal of Sociology 86, 90–118.
- Cook, P. J. (1986), 'The demand and supply of criminal opportunities'.
 In: M. Tonry and N. Morris (eds.): *Crime and Justice: An Annual Review of Research*. pp. 1–28, University of Chicago Press.
- Corman, H. and N. Mocan (2005), 'Carrots, sticks, and broken windows'. Journal of Law and Economics 46, 235–266.
- Cornwell, C. and W. N. Trumbull (1994), 'Estimating the economic model of crime with panel data'. The Review of Economics and Statistics 76, 360–366.
- Dana, D. A. (2001), 'Rethinking the puzzle of escalating penalties for repeat offenders'. Yale Law Journal 110, 733–783.
- Danziger, S. and D. Wheeler (1975), 'The economics of crime: Punishment or income distribution'. *Review of Social Economy* pp. 113–131.
- Deadman, D., D. Pyle, and S. Pudney (1997). The effect of underreporting in statistical models of criminal activity: Estimation of an error correction model with measurement error, Department of Economics, University of Leicester, Discussion Paper in Economics 97/3.
- Dezhbakhsh, H., P. Rubin, and J. M. Shepherd (2003), 'Does capital punishment have a deterrent effect? New evidence from postmoratorium panel data'. American Law and Economics Review 5, 344–376.
- Dezhbakhsh, H. and P. H. Rubin (1998), 'Lives saved or lives lost? The effects of concealed-handgun laws on crime'. The American Economic Review 88(2), 468–474.

- Dezhbakhsh, H. and P. H. Rubin (2003), 'The effect of concealed handgun laws on crime: Beyond the dummy variables'. *International Review of Law and Economics* **23**(2), 199–216.
- Dezhbakhsh, H. and J. M. Shepherd, 'The deterrent effect of capital punishment: Evidence from a 'Judicial Experiment". *Economic Inquiry*, vol. 44, forthcoming 2006, *available at* http://ei .oxfordjournals.org/cgi/reprint/ cbj032v1.
- Dhiri, S., S. Brand, R. Harries, and R. Price (1999), 'Modeling and predicting property crime trends in England and Wales'. In: *Home* Office Research Study, Vol. 198. Home Office.
- Di Tella, R. and E. Schargrodsky (2004), 'Do police reduce crime? Estimates using the allocation of police forces after a terrorist attack'. *American Economic Review* **94**, 115–133.
- Dobash, R. E. and R. P. Dobash (1984), 'The nature and antecedents of violent events'. British Journal of Criminology 24, 269–288.
- Donohue, J. J. and J. Wolfers (2005), 'Uses and abuses of empirical evidence in the death penalty debate'. *Stanford Law Review* 58, 791–846.
- Donohue III, J. J. and S. D. Levitt (2001), 'The impact of legalized abortion on crime'. *Quarterly Journal of Economics* **116**(2), 379–420.
- Donohue III, J. J. and S. D. Levitt (2004), 'Further evidence that legalized abortion lowered crime: A reply to joyce'. *Journal of Human Resources* **39**, 29–49.
- Edmark, K. (2005), 'Unemployment and crime: Is there a connection?'. Scandinavian Journal of Economics **107**, 353–373.
- Ehrlich, I. (1972), 'The deterrent effect of criminal law enforcement'. Journal of Legal Studies 1, 259–276.
- Ehrlich, I. (1973), 'Participation in illegitimate activities: A theoretical and empirical investigation'. Journal of Political Economy 81, 521–565.
- Ehrlich, I. (1975), 'The deterrent effect of capital punishment: A question of life and death'. *American Economic Review* **65**, 397–417.
- Ehrlich, I. (1977), 'Capital punishment and deterrence: Some further thoughts and additional evidence'. *Journal of Political Economy* 85, 741–788.

- Ehrlich, I. (1981), 'On the usefulness of controlling individuals: An economic analysis of rehabilitation, incapacitation and deterrence'. *American Economic Review* **71**, 307–332.
- Ehrlich, I. (1982), 'The market for offences and the public enforcement of laws: An equilibrium analysis'. British Journal of Psychology 21, 107–120.
- Ehrlich, I. (1996), 'Crime, punishment and the market for offenses'. Journal of Economic Perspectives 10, 43–67.
- Ehrlich, I. and Z. Liu (1999), 'Sensitivity analysis of the deterrence hypothesis: let's keep the econ in econometrics'. *Journal of Law and Economics* 42, 455–488.
- Ehrlich I. in co-operation with R. Mark *et al.* (1977), 'Fear of deterrence: A critical evaluation of the 'report of the panel on research on deterrent and incapacitative effects' '. *Journal of Legal Studies* 6, 293–316.
- Eide, E. (1973), 'Economics of criminal behavior'. Encyclopedia of Law and Economics 5, 345–369.
- Eide, E. (1995), 'RDEU models of crime'. Institutt for Privatrett University of Oslo, Working Paper Law and Economics, C1.
- Eide E., in cooperation with, J. Aasness and T. Skjerpen (1994), Economics of Crime: Deterrence and the Rational Offender, Contributions to Economic Analysis. Oxford and Tokyo: North-Holland, Amsterdam.
- Ekelund, R. B., J. D. Jackson, R. W. Ressler, and R. D. Tollison (2006), 'Marginal deterrence and multiple murders'. *Southern Economic Journal* 72, 521–541.
- Emons, W. (2003), 'A note on the optimal punishment for repeat offenders'. *International Review of Law and Economics* 23, 253–259.
- Entorf, H. and H. Spengler (1998), 'Socio-economic and demographic factors of crime in germany: Evidence from panel data of the German states'. *International Review of Law and Economics* **20**, 75–106.
- Evans, W. N. and E. Owens (2006), 'COPS and crime'. Forthcoming.
- Fajnzylber, P., D. Lederman, and N. Loayza (1998), Determinants of Crime Rates in Latin America and the World – An Empirical Assessment. Washington, DC: . The World Bank.

- Fajnzylber, P., D. Lederman, and N. Loayza (2002a), 'Inequality and violent crime'. Journal of Law and Economics 45, 1–40.
- Fajnzylber, P., D. Lederman, and N. Loayza (2002b), 'What causes violent crime?'. European Economic Review 46, 1323–1356.
- Fisher, F. M. and D. S. Nagin (1978), 'On the feasibility of identifying the crime function in a simultaneous model of crime rates and sanction levels'. In: A. Blumstein, J. Cohen, and D. S. Nagin (eds.): Deterrence and Incapacitation: Estimating the Effects of Criminal Sanctions on Crime Rates. pp. 361–399, National Academy of Sciences.
- Forst, B. (1976), 'Participation in illegitimate activities: Further empirical findings'. Policy Analysis 2, 477–492.
- Freeman, R. B. (1995), 'The labor market'. In: J. Q. Wilson and J. Petersilia (eds.): *Crime*. pp. 171–191, Institute for Contemporary Studies.
- Freeman, R. B. (1999), 'The economics of crime'. In: O. Ashenfelter and D. Card (eds.): *Handbook of Labor Economics*, Vol. 3. pp. 3529–3571.
- Freeman, R. B. and W. M. Rodgers III (1999), 'Area economic conditions and the labor market outcomes of young men in the 1990s expansion'. NBER Working Paper 7073.
- Freidman, D. (1999), 'Why not hang them all: The virtues of inefficient punishment'. Journal of Political Economy 107, 259–269.
- Furlong, W. J. and S. L. Mehay (1981), 'Urban law enforcement in Canada: An empirical analysis'. *Canadian Journal of Economics* 14, 44–57.
- Garoupa, N. (1997), 'The theory of optimal law enforcement'. Journal of Economic Surveys 11, 267–295.
- Garoupa, N. (1999), 'Optimal law enforcement with dissemination of information'. European Journal of Law and Economics 7, 183–196.
- Garoupa, N. and D. Klerman (2002), 'Optimal law enforcement with a rent-seeking government'. *American Law and Economics Review* 4, 116–140.
- Glaeser, E. L., D. P. Kessler, and A. M. Piehl (2000), 'What do prosecutors maximize? An analysis of the federalization of drug crimes'. *American Law and Economics Review* 2, 259–290.

- Glaeser, E. L. and B. Sacerdote (1999), 'Why is there more crime in cities?'. Journal of Political Economy 107, S225–S258.
- Goldberg, I. and F. C. Nold (1980), 'Does reporting deter burglars? An empirical analysis of risk and return in crime'. *Review of Economics* and Statistics 62, 424–431.
- Gould, E., B. Weinberg, and D. Mustard (2002), 'Crime rates and local labor market opportunities in the united states: 1979–1995'. *The Review of Economics and Statistics* 84, 45–61.
- Greenberg, D. F. (2001a), 'On theory, models, model-testing, and estimation'. Journal of Quantitative Criminology 17, 409–422.
- Greenberg, D. F. (2001b), 'Time series analysis of crime rates'. Journal of Quantitative Criminology 17, 291–327.
- Grossman, G. M. and M. L. Katz (1983), 'Plea bargaining and social welfare'. American Economic Review 73, 749–757.
- Heineke, J. M. (ed.) (1978), Economic Models of Criminal Behaviour. North Holland, Amsterdam.
- Holtmann, A. G. and L. Yap (1978), 'Does punishment pay?'. Public Finance 33, 90–97.
- Imai, S. and K. Krishna (2004), 'Employment, deterrence, and crime in a dynamic model'. *International Economic Review* 45, 845–872.
- Innes, R. (1999), 'Remediation and self-reporting in optimal law enforcement'. Journal of Public Economics 72, 379–393.
- Innes, R. (2000), 'Self-reporting in optimal law enforcement when violators have heterogeneous probabilities of apprehension'. *Journal of Legal Studies* 29, 287–300.
- Joyce, T. (2003), 'Did legalized abortion lower crime?'. Journal of Human Resources 38, 1–37.
- Kaplow, L. (1990a), 'A note on the optimal use of nonmonetary sanctions'. Journal of Public Economics 42, 245–247.
- Kaplow, L. (1990b), 'Optimal deterrence, uninformed individuals, and acquiring information about whether acts are subject to sanctions'. *Journal of Law, Economics, and Organization* 6, 93–128.
- Kaplow, L. (1992), 'The optimal probability and magnitude of fines for acts that definitely are undesirable'. *International Review of Law* and Economics **12**, 3–11.

- Kaplow, L. and S. Shavell (1994a), 'Accuracy in the determination of liability'. Journal of Law and Economics 37, 1–15.
- Kaplow, L. and S. Shavell (1994b), 'Optimal law enforcement with self– reporting of behavior'. *Journal of Political Economy* **102**, 583–606.
- Katz, L., S. D. Levitt, and E. Shustorovich (2003), 'Prison conditions, capital punishment, and deterrence'. American Law and Economics Review 5, 318–343.
- Kessler, D. and S. D. Levitt (1999), 'Using sentence enhancements to distinguish between deterrence and incapacitation'. *Journal of Law* and Economics 42, 343–363.
- Klein, L. R., B. Forst, and V. Filatov (1978), 'The deterrent effect of capital punishment: An assessment of the estimates'. In: A. Blumstein, J. Cohen, and D. S. Nagin (eds.): Deterrence and Incapacitation: Estimating the Effects of Criminal Sanctions on Crime Rates. Washington, DC, pp. 336–360, National Academy of Sciences.
- Klepper, S. and D. S. Nagin (1989), 'The anatomy of tax evasion'. Journal of Law, Economics, and Organization 5, 1–24.
- Klick, J. and A. Tabarrok (2005), 'Using terror alert levels to estimate the effect of police on crime'. *Journal of Law and Economics* 48, 267–279.
- Kobayashi, B. H. and J. R. Lott Jr. (1992), 'Low-probability-highpenalty enforcement strategies and the efficient operation of the pleabargaining system'. *International Review of Law and Economics* 12, 69–77.
- Kolm, S. C. (1973), 'A note on optimal tax evasion'. Journal of Public Economics 2, 265–270.
- Land, K. C., P. McCall, and L. Cohen (1990), 'Structural covariates of homicide rates: Are there any invariances across time and social space'. *American Journal of Sociology* **95**, 922–963.
- Landes, W. M. (1971), 'An economic analysis of the courts'. Journal of Law and Economics 4, 61–107.
- Landes, W. M. (1978), 'An economic study of U.S. aircraft hijacking, 1961–1976'. Journal of Law and Economics 21, 1–31.
- Landes, W. M. and R. Posner (1975), 'The private enforcement of law'. Journal of Legal Studies 4, 1–46.

- Lattimore, P. and A. Witte (1986), 'Models of decision making under uncertainty: The criminal choice'. In: D. B. Cornish and R. V. G. Clarke (eds.): *The Reasoning Criminal*. pp. 129–155, Springer Verlag.
- Layson, S. K. (1985), 'Homicide and deterrence: A reexamination of the United States time series evidence'. Southern Economic Journal 52, 68–89.
- Lee, D. S. and J. McCrary (2005), 'Crime, punishment, and myopia'. *NBER Working Paper*.
- Lejeune, R. (1977), 'Management of a mugging'. Urban Life 6, 123–148.
- Levitt, S. D. (1995), 'Why do increased arrests rates appear to reduce crime: Deterrence, incapacitation, or measurement error?'. *Economic Inquiry* 36, 353–372.
- Levitt, S. D. (1998), 'Juvenile crime and punishment'. Journal of Political Economy 106, 1156–1184.
- Levitt, S. D. (2001), 'Alternative strategies for identifying the link between unemployment and crime'. Journal of Quantitative Criminology 17, 377–390.
- Levitt, S. D. and S. Dubner (2005), Freakonomics: A Rogue Economist Explains the Hidden Side of Everything. New York: HarperCollins.
- Lewin, J. L. and W. N. Trumbull (1990), 'The social value of crime?'. International Review of Law and Economics 10, 271–284.
- Liu, Z. (2004), 'Capital punishment and the deterrence hypothesis: Some new insights and empirical evidence'. *Eastern Economic Jour*nal **30**, 237–258.
- Lott Jr., J. R. (1992), 'Do we punish high income criminals too heavily?'. *Economic Inquiry* **30**, 583–608.
- Lott Jr., J. R. (1998), More Guns, Less Crime: Understanding Crime and Gun Control Laws. University of Chicago Press.
- Lott Jr., J. R. (2003), The Bias Against Guns: Why Almost Everything You've Heard about Gun Control is Wrong. Regnery Publishing. Inc.
- Lott Jr., J. R. and W. M. Landes (2000), 'Multiple victim public shootings, bombings, and right-to-carry concealed handgun laws: Contrasting private and public law enforcement'. John M. Olin Law and Economics Working Paper No. 73, University of Chicago Law School.

- Lott Jr., J. R. and D. B. Mustard (1997), 'Crime, deterrence, and rightto-Carry concealed handgun laws'. *Journal of Legal Studies*.
- Machin, S. and C. Meghir (2000), 'Crime and economic incentives'. *The Institute For Fiscal Studies Working Paper*, Department of Economics, University College, London, W 00/17.
- Malik, A. S. (1990), 'Avoidance, screening and optimum enforcement'. RAND Journal of Economics 21, 341–353.
- Malik, A. S. (1993), 'Self-reporting and the design of policies for regulating stochastic pollution'. *Journal of Environmental Economics* and Management 24, 241–257.
- Manski, C. F. (1978), 'Prospects for Inference on Deterrence through Empirical Analysis of Individual Criminal Behavior'. In: A. Blumstein, J. Cohen, and D. S. Nagin (eds.): Deterrence and Incapacitation: Estimating the Effects of Criminal Sanctions on Crime Rates. National Academy of Sciences, pp. 400–424, Washington DC.
- Marris, R. and V. Consulting (2000), 'Survey of the research literature on the criminological and economic factors influencing crime trends'. Report to the British Home Office, http://www.homeoffice .gov.uk/rds/pdfs2/occ80modellingsup.pdf.
- Marvell, T. B. and C. E. Moody (1996), 'Specification problems, police levels, and crime rates'. *Criminology* 34, 609–646.
- Mathieson, D. and P. Passell (1976), 'Homicide and robbery in New York City: An economic model'. Journal of Legal Studies 5, 83–98.
- Mathur, V. K. (1978), 'Economics of crime: An investigation of the deterrent hypothesis for urban areas'. *Review of Economics and Statistics* **60**, 459–466.
- Miceli, T. J. (1991), 'Optimal criminal procedure: Fairness and deterrence'. International Review of Law and Economics 11, 3–10.
- Miceli, T. J. (1996), 'Plea bargaining and deterrence: An institutional approach'. *European Journal of Law and Economics* **3**, 249–264.
- Miceli, T. J. and C. Bucci (2005), 'A simple theory of increasing penalties for repeat offenders'. *Review of Law and Economics* 1, 71–80.
- Mocan, H. N. and R. K. Gittings (2003), 'Getting off death row: Commuted sentences and the deterrent effect of capital punishment'. *Journal of Law and Economics* 46, 453–478.

- Mookherjee, D. (1997), 'The economics of enforcement'. In: A. Bose, M. Rakshit, and A. Sinha (eds.): Issues in Economic Theory and Policy, Essays in Honor of Tapas Majumdar. New Delhi, pp. 202– 249, Oxford University Press.
- Mookherjee, D. and I. P. L. Png (1992), 'Monitoring vis-à-vis investigation in enforcement of law'. *American Economic Review* 82, 556–565.
- Mookherjee, D. and I. P. L. Png (1994), 'Marginal deterrence in enforcement of law'. Journal of Political Economy 102, 1039–1066.
- Mookherjee, D. and I. P. L. Png (1995), 'Corruptible law enforcers: How should they be compensated?'. *Economic Journal* **105**, 145–159.
- Mustard, D. B. (2003), 'Reexamining criminal behavior: The importance of omitted variable bias'. The Review of Economics and Statistics 85, 205–211.
- Myers Jr., S. L. (1980), 'Why are crimes underreported? What is the crime rate? Does it really matter?'. Social Science Quarterly 6, 23–43.
- Myers Jr., S. L. (1982), 'Crime in urban areas: New evidence and results'. *Journal of Urban Economics* **11**, 148–158.
- Myers Jr., S. L. (1983), 'Estimating the economic model of crime: Employment versus punishment effects'. Quarterly Journal of Economics 98, 157–175.
- Nagin, D. S. (1978), 'General deterrence: A review of the empirical evidence'. In: A. Blumstein, J. Cohen, and D. S. Nagin (eds.): Deterrence and Incapacitation: Estimating the Effects of Criminal Sanctions on Crime Rates. pp. 95–139, National Academy of Sciences.
- Nagin, D. S. (1998), 'Criminal deterrence research at the outset of the twenty-first century'. In: M. Tondry (ed.): Crime and Justice: A Review of Research. Chicago University Press.
- Nagin, D. S. and R. A. Paternoster (1993), 'Enduring individual differences and rational choice theories of crime'. *Law and Society Review* 27, 467–496.
- Neumayer, E. (2005), 'Inequality and violent crime: Evidence from data on robbery and violent theft'. *Journal of Peace Research* **42**, 101–112.
- Niggli, M. A. (1994), 'Rational choice theory and crime prevention'. Studies on Crime and Crime Prevention 3, 83–103.

- O'Brien, R. M. (2001), 'Theory, operationalization, identification, and the interpretation of different differences in time series models'. *Jour*nal of Quantitative Criminology 17, 359–375.
- Ormerod, P., C. Mounfield, and L. Smith (2003). Non-linear modeling of burglary and violent crime in the UK. in *Modeling Crime and Offending: Recent Developments in England and Wales*, Occasional Paper No 80, Home Office, Section B.
- Orsagh, T. (1973), 'Crime, sanctions and scientific explanation'. Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology 64, 354–361.
- Orsagh, T. (1979), 'Empirical criminology: Interpreting results derived from aggregate data'. Journal of Research in Crime and Delinquency 16, 294–306.
- Papps, K. and R. Winkelmann (2000), 'Unemployment and crime: New evidence for an old question'. New Zealand Economic Papers 34, 53–72.
- Passell, P. and J. B. Taylor (1977), 'The deterrent effect of capital punishment: Another view'. American Economic Review 67, 445–451.
- Paternoster, R. and S. D. Bushway (2001), 'Theoretical and empirical work on the relationship between unemployment and crime'. *Journal* of Quantitative Criminology 17, 391–402.
- Phillips, L. and H. L. Votey Jr. (1972), 'An economic analysis of the deterrent effect of law enforcement on criminal activity'. *Journal of Criminal Law, Criminology and Police Science* 63, 330–342.
- Phillips, L. and H. L. Votey Jr. (1975), 'Crime control in California'. Journal of Legal Studies 4, 327–349.
- Phillips, L. and H. L. Votey Jr. (1981), The Economics of Crime Control. Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.
- Polinsky, A. M. (1980), 'Private versus public enforcement of fines'. Journal of Legal Studies 9, 105–127.
- Polinsky, A. M. and D. L. Rubinfeld (1989), 'A note on optimal public enforcement with settlements and litigation costs'. *Research in Law* and Economics 12, 1–8.
- Polinsky, A. M. and D. L. Rubinfeld (1991), 'A model of optimal fines for repeat offenders'. *Journal of Public Economics* 46, 291–306.

- Polinsky, A. M. and S. Shavell (1979), 'The optimal tradeoff between the probability and magnitude of fines'. *American Economic Review* 69, 880–891.
- Polinsky, A. M. and S. Shavell (1984), 'The optimal use of fines and imprisonment'. *Journal of Public Economics* 24, 89–99.
- Polinsky, A. M. and S. Shavell (1998), 'On offense history and the theory of deterrence'. *International Review of Law and Economics* 18, 305–324.
- Polinsky, A. M. and S. Shavell (1999), 'On the disutility and discounting of imprisonment and the theory of deterrence'. *Journal of Legal Studies* 28, 1–16.
- Polinsky, A. M. and S. Shavell (2001), 'Corruption and optimal law enforcement'. *Journal of Public Economics* 81, 1–24.
- Polinsky, A. M. and S. Shavell (2005), 'The theory of public enforcement of law'. John M. Olin Center for Law, Economics, and Business Discussion Paper No. 529, available at http://ssrn.com/ abstract=850264.
- Prisching, M. (1982), 'Sozioökonomische bedingungen der kriminalität. Über empirische divergenzen und theoretische kontroversen (Socio-economic conditions of criminality. On empirical divergencies and theoretical controversies)'. Monatsschrift für Kriminologie und Strafrechtsreform 65, 163–176.
- Pudney, S., D. Deadman, and D. Pyle (2000), 'The relationship between crime, punishment and economic conditions: Is reliable inference possible when crimes are under-recorded?'. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society* 163, 81–97.
- Pyle, D. J. (1983), The Economics of Crime and Law Enforcement. London: MacMillan.
- Pyle, D. J. and D. F. Deadman (1994), 'Crime and the business cycle in post-war Britain'. British Journal of Criminology 34, 339–357.
- Raphael, S. and R. Winter-Ebmer (2001), 'Identifying the effect of unemployment on crime'. *Journal of Law and Economics* 44, 259–283.
- Reinganum, J. F. (1988), 'Plea bargaining and prosecutorial discretion'. American Economic Review 78, 713–728.

- Rubinstein, A. (1979), 'An optimal conviction policy for offenses that may have been committed by accident'. In: S. J. Brams, A. Schotter, and G. Schwödiauer (eds.): Applied Game Theory. Wurzburg, pp. 406–413, Physica-Verlag.
- Rubinstein, A. (1980), 'On an anomaly of the deterrent effect of punishment'. *Economics Letters* **6**, 89–94.
- Sah, R. K. (1991), 'Social osmosis and patterns of crime'. Jouurnal of Political Economy 99, 1272–1295.
- Saridakis, G. (2004), 'Violent crime in the United States of America: A time-series analysis between 1960–2000'. European Journal of Law and Economics 18, 203–221.
- Schmidt, P. and A. D. Witte (1984), An Economic Analysis of Crime and Justice: Theory, Methods, and Applications. New York: Academic Press.
- Schuller, B.-J. (1986), Ekonomi och Kriminalitet: En Empirisk Undersöking av Brottsligheten i Sverige. Economiska studier utgivna av Nationalekonomiska institutionen vid Göteborgs Universitet.
- Sesnowitz, M. L. and L. Hexter (1982), 'Economic determinants of theft: Some empirical results'. *Public Finance Quarterly* 10, 489–498.
- Shavell, S. (1985), 'Criminal law and the optimal use of nonmonetary sanctions as a deterrent'. *Columbia Law Review* **85**, 1232–1262.
- Shavell, S. (ed.) (1987), A model of optimal incapacitation, Vol. 77 of American Economic Review: Papers and Proceedings, pp. 107–110.
- Shavell, S. (1991), 'Specific versus general enforcement of law'. Journal of Political Economy 99, 1088–1108.
- Shavell, S. (1992), 'A note on marginal deterrence'. International Review of Law and Economics 12, 345–355.
- Shepherd, J. M. (2002), 'Fear of the first strike: The full deterrent effect of California's two- and three-strikes legislation'. *Journal of Legal Studies* **31**, 159–201.
- Shepherd, J. M. (2004), 'Murders of passion, execution delays, and the deterrence of capital punishment'. *Journal of Legal Studies* 33, 283–321.
- Singh, B. (1973), 'Making honesty the best policy'. Journal of Public Economics 2, 257–263.

- Sjoquist, D. L. (1973), 'Property crime and economic behavior: Some empirical results'. American Economic Review 63, 439–446.
- Slemrod, J. (1985), 'An empirical test of tax evasion'. Review of Economics and Statistics 67, 232–238.
- Sorenson, J., R. Wrinkle, V. Brewer, and J. Marquart (1999), 'Capital punishment and deterrence: Examining the effect of executions on murder in Texas'. *Crime and Delinquency* 45, 481–493.
- Stigler, G. J. (1970), 'The optimum enforcement of laws'. Journal of Political Economy 78, 526–536.
- Stolzenberg, L. and S. J. D'Alessio (2004), 'Criminology: Capital punishment, execution publicity and murder in Houston, Texas'. *Journal* of Criminal Law and Criminology 94, 351–379.
- Swimmer, E. R. (1974), 'Measurement of the effectiveness of urban law enforcement-a simultaneous approach'. Southern Economic Journal 40, 618–630.
- Taylor, J. B. (1978), 'Econometric models of criminal behavior: A review'. In: J. M. Heineke (ed.): *Economics of Criminal Behavior*. pp. 35–81.
- Thaler, R. H. (1977), 'An econometrie analysis of property crime: Interaction between police and criminals'. *Journal of Public Economics* 8, 37–51.
- Travaglini, G. (2005), 'Property crime and law enforcement in italy. A regional panel analysis 1980–1995'. http://ideas.repec.org/p/wpa/wuwpem/0512001.html.
- Trumbull, W. N. (1989), 'Estimations of the economic model of crime using aggregate and individual level data'. Southern Economic Journal 56, 423–439.
- Tunnell, K. D. (1992), Choosing Crime: The Criminal Calculus of Propert. Offenders. Chicago: Nelson-Hall.
- Vandaele, W. (1978), 'Participation in illegitimate activities: Ehrlich revisited'. In: A. Blumstein, J. Cohen, and D. S. Nagin (eds.): Deterrence and Incapacitation: Estimating the Effects of Criminal Sanctions on Crime Rates. pp. 270–335, National Academy of Sciences.
- Viscusi, W. K. (1986), 'The risks and rewards of criminal activity: A comprehensive test of criminal deterrence'. *Journal of Labor Economics* 4, 317–340.

- Wahlroos, B. (1981), 'On Finnish property criminality: An empirical analysis of the post war era using an Ehrlich model'. Scandinavian Journal of Economics 83, 553–562.
- Wilde, L. L. (1992), 'Criminal choice, nonmonetary sanctions, and marginal deterrence: A normative analysis'. *International Review of Law and Economics* 12, 333–344.
- Wilson, J. Q. and B. Boland (1978), 'The effect of the police on crime'. Law and Society Review 12, 367–390.
- Wilson, J. Q. and R. J. Herrnstein (1985), Crime and Human Nature. New York: Simon and Schuster.
- Witte, A. D. (1980), 'Estimating the economic model of crime with individual data'. Quarterly Journal of Economics 94, 57–84.
- Witte, A. D. and D. Woodbury (1985), 'The effect of tax laws and tax administration on tax compliance: The case of the U.S. individual income tax'. *National Tax Journal* **38**, 1–13.
- Wolpin, K. I. (1978), 'An economic analysis of crime and punishment in England and Wales, 1894–1967'. Journal of Political Economy 86, 815–840.
- Wolpin, K. I. (1980), 'A time series cross section analysis of international variation in crime and punishment'. *Review of Economics and Statistics* 62, 417–423.
- Yunker, J. A. (2002), 'A new statistical analysis of capital punishment incorporating U.S. postmoratorium data'. Social Science Quarterly 82, 297–311.
- Zimmerman, P. R. (2004), 'State executions, deterrence, and the incidence murder'. Journal of Applied Economics 7, 163–193.