Semicollusion
Semicollusion

Frode Steen

Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration
5045 Bergen
Norway
frode.steen@nhh.no

Lars Sørgard

Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration
5045 Bergen
Norway
lars.sorgard@nhh.no

Full text available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.1561/0700000034
Foundations and Trends® in Microeconomics

Published, sold and distributed by:
now Publishers Inc.
PO Box 1024
Hanover, MA 02339
USA
Tel. +1-781-985-4510
www.nowpublishers.com
sales@nowpublishers.com

Outside North America:
now Publishers Inc.
PO Box 179
2600 AD Delft
The Netherlands
Tel. +31-6-51115274

The preferred citation for this publication is F. Steen and L. Sørgard, Semicollusion, Foundations and Trends® in Microeconomics, vol 5, no 3, pp 153–228, 2009

© 2010 F. Steen and L. Sørgard

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

Photocopying. In the USA: This journal is registered at the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, or the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by now Publishers Inc for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC). The ‘services’ for users can be found on the internet at: www.copyright.com

For those organizations that have been granted a photocopy license, a separate system of payment has been arranged. Authorization does not extend to other kinds of copying, such as that for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. In the rest of the world: Permission to photocopy must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to now Publishers Inc., PO Box 1024, Hanover, MA 02339, USA; Tel. +1-781-871-0245; www.nowpublishers.com; sales@nowpublishers.com

now Publishers Inc. has an exclusive license to publish this material worldwide. Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright license holder. Please apply to now Publishers, PO Box 179, 2600 AD Delft, The Netherlands, www.nowpublishers.com; e-mail: sales@nowpublishers.com
Editorial Scope

Foundations and Trends® in Microeconomics will publish survey and tutorial articles in the following topics:

- Environmental Economics
- Contingent Valuation
- Environmental Health Risks
- Climate Change
- Endangered Species
- Market-based Policy Instruments
- Health Economics
- Moral Hazard
- Medical Care Markets
- Medical Malpractice
- Insurance economics
- Industrial Organization
- Theory of the Firm
- Regulatory Economics
- Market Structure
- Auctions
- Monopolies and Antitrust
- Transaction Cost Economics
- Labor Economics
- Labor Supply
- Labor Demand
- Labor Market Institutions
- Search Theory
- Wage Structure
- Income Distribution
- Race and Gender
- Law and Economics
- Models of Litigation
- Crime
- Torts, Contracts and Property
- Constitutional Law
- Public Economics
- Public Goods
- Environmental Taxation
- Social Insurance
- Public Finance
- International Taxation

Information for Librarians
Foundations and Trends® in Microeconomics, 2009, Volume 5, 8 issues. ISSN paper version 1547-9846. ISSN online version 1547-9854. Also available as a combined paper and online subscription.
Semicollusion*

Frode Steen\(^1\) and Lars Sørgard\(^2\)

\(^1\) Department of Economics, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration, Helleveien 30, 5045 Bergen, Norway, frode.steen@nhh.no
\(^2\) Department of Economics, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration, Helleveien 30, 5045 Bergen, Norway, lars.sorgard@nhh.no

Abstract

The notion ‘semicollusion’ refers to situations where firms collude in one (or several) choice variable(s) and compete in others. For example, firms collude on prices and compete on advertising. Although the notion ‘semicollusion’ is not so often used explicitly, it turns out that the topic is covered extensively in the economic literature. Moreover, the phenomena ‘semicollusion’ seem to be present in numerous industries. The purpose of this survey is to explain how semicollusion works in theory, describe empirical studies of semicollusion, and discuss the possible welfare effects of semicollusion.

*We are indebted to an anonymous referee and Joseph E. Harrington, Jr. for their helpful comments on an earlier draft.
Contents

1 Introduction 1

2 What is Semicollusion? 3
   2.1 A Definition 3
   2.2 Anecdotal Evidence 5
   2.3 The Rules of the Game 9

3 Theory of Semicollusion 13
   3.1 A Preliminary 14
   3.2 Collusion on Prices 15
   3.3 Competition on Prices 34
   3.4 Semicollusion with Free Entry 42

4 Empirical Findings 47
   4.1 Collusion on Prices 48
   4.2 Competition on Prices 62

5 Some Concluding Remarks 67

References 71
Collusion and competition are well-known concepts in economic literature. A typical study would consider either the competitive outcome or the (stability of) the collusive outcome in an industry, and it might be undertaken a comparison between a competitive and a collusive outcome. But is this the only possible comparison? What about the possible combinations of competition and collusion in an industry? Could it be that firms collude, and at the same time compete? How could that work in theory? Do we observe some empirical evidence of such a mixture of competition and collusion, a market outcome we will characterize as semicollusion?

The notion “semicollusion” refers to situations where firms collude in one (or several) choice variable(s) and compete in others. For example, firms collude on prices and compete on advertising. Although the notion “semicollusion” is not so often used explicitly, it turns out that the topic is covered extensively in the economic literature. Moreover, the phenomena “semicollusion” seem to be present in numerous industries. The purpose of this survey is to explain how semicollusion works in theory, describe empirical studies of semicollusion, and discuss the possible welfare effects of semicollusion.
Introduction

The monograph will start with a section where we motivate for why semicollusion is an important topic. The concept will be defined, to distinguish between collusion and semicollusion. We give some examples of what we regard as semicollusive behavior in particular industries. Moreover, we also discuss the rules of the game and which choice variables we expect firms to collude on.

In the third section we will provide a framework for understanding the mechanism at work with semicollusion. In one strand of the literature it is assumed that firms collude on prices and compete on other choice variables such as advertising, capacities, or location. However, there is also another strand of the literature where firms compete on prices and collude along other dimensions. In particular, it is assumed that firms collude on R&D. We also discuss the possible outcome with semicollusion in industries with free entry.

In Section 4 we review the empirical literature on semicollusion. There are some old, anecdotal evidence of semicollusion. For example, Scherer and Ross (1990) refer to several events in various industries. We will briefly refer to some of these cases. However, in the main part of the section we concentrate on empirical studies of the effects of semicollusion. There are empirical studies that cover various types of collusion, for example collusion on prices or collusion on R&D, and we discuss empirical studies for those outcomes that were covered in Section 3.

In Section 5 we summarize our findings. We offer some general conclusions, and discuss some issues for future research.
References


References


Goeree, M. S. and E. Helland (2008), ‘Do research ventures serve a collusive function?’. Mimeo.


References


References


