# Water and Economy-Wide Policy Interventions

### **Ariel Dinar**

Water Science and Policy Center Department of Environmental Sciences University of California, Riverside, USA ariel.dinar@ucr.edu



## Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Microeconomics

Published, sold and distributed by: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 1024 Hanover, MA 02339 United States Tel. +1-781-985-4510 www.nowpublishers.com sales@nowpublishers.com

Outside North America: now Publishers Inc. PO Box 179 2600 AD Delft The Netherlands Tel. +31-6-51115274

The preferred citation for this publication is

A. Dinar. Water and Economy-Wide Policy Interventions. Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Microeconomics, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 85–165, 2014.

This Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> issue was typeset in  $ET_EX$  using a class file designed by Neal Parikh. Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN: 978-1-60198-849-2 © 2014 A. Dinar

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

Photocopying. In the USA: This journal is registered at the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, or the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by now Publishers Inc for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC). The 'services' for users can be found on the internet at: www.copyright.com

For those organizations that have been granted a photocopy license, a separate system of payment has been arranged. Authorization does not extend to other kinds of copying, such as that for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. In the rest of the world: Permission to photocopy must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to now Publishers Inc., PO Box 1024, Hanover, MA 02339, USA; Tel. +1 781 871 0245; www.nowpublishers.com; sales@nowpublishers.com

now Publishers Inc. has an exclusive license to publish this material worldwide. Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright license holder. Please apply to now Publishers, PO Box 179, 2600 AD Delft, The Netherlands, www.nowpublishers.com; e-mail: sales@nowpublishers.com

# Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Microeconomics Volume 10, Issue 2, 2014 Editorial Board

### **Editor-in-Chief**

W. Kip Viscusi Vanderbilt University Law School United States

### Editors

Richard Carson University of California, San Diego William Gentry Williams College

Tom Kniesner Syracuse University

Mark V. Pauly University of Pennsylvania

Yossi Spiegel Tel Aviv University

William Zame Unversity of California, Los Angeles

James Ziliak University of Kentucky

# **Editorial Scope**

### Topics

Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Microeconomics publishes survey and tutorial articles in the following topics:

- Environmental economics
- Health economics

- Labor economics
- Law and economics
- Industrial organization
- Public economics

### Information for Librarians

Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Microeconomics, 2014, Volume 10, 4 issues. ISSN paper version 1547-9846. ISSN online version 1547-9854. Also available as a combined paper and online subscription.

Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Microeconomics Vol. 10, No. 2 (2014) 85–165 © 2014 A. Dinar DOI: 10.1561/0700000059



### Water and Economy-Wide Policy Interventions<sup>1</sup>

Ariel Dinar Water Science and Policy Center Department of Environmental Sciences University of California, Riverside, USA ariel.dinar@ucr.edu

<sup>1</sup>This monograph benefitted from discussions and joint work with Erol Cacmak, Xinshen Diao, Rachid Doukkali, Rashid Hassan, Terry Roe, Yacov Tsur, and Antonio Yunez-Naude during the two phases of the World Bank research project 'Macro-Micro Linkages of Irrigation Water Management' during 2000–2007. The author acknowledges the help by Juanita A. Frisbie in conducting the search for and compilation of references of recent published studies on economy-wide and water studies. Financial support for the preparation of this monograph was provided by the World Bank, Environment and Energy Research Program, Development Research Group.

# Contents

1	Intro	oduction	2
2	Wha	at is New? A Short Literature Update	5
3	The	Macro–Micro Linkage Framework	7
	3.1	The building blocks	8
	3.2	The farm model	10
	3.3	The macro model	11
	3.4	Feedback links	13
	3.5	How other sectors are linked and modeled	14
4	Des	cription of the Policy Issues	15
	4.1	Mexico	15
	4.2	Morocco	16
	4.3	South Africa	16
	4.4	Turkey	22
5	The	Empirical Framework	23
	5.1	Features for Morocco	23
	5.2	Features for Mexico	43
	5.3	Features for South Africa	50
	5.4	Features for Turkey	54

٠	٠	٠	
L	L	н	

6	Conclusion					
	6.1	Mexico	60			
	6.2	Morocco	62			
	6.3	South Africa	63			
	6.4	Turkey	64			
6.5 A word on the value of macro–micro linkage						
		CGE approach	65			
An	nex		66			
Re	References					

### Abstract

Water is a limiting factor for sustainable economic growth and development in many countries. Its allocation has significant impacts on overall economic efficiency, particularly with growing physical scarcity in certain regions. Water also has become a strategic resource, involving conflicts among those who may be affected differently by various policies. This monograph reviews work that models various policy interventions aimed at improving water allocation decisions with an economy-wide context. It focuses on the "macro-micro linkage" framework that facilitates assessment of various linkages among policies and their impacts within individual sectors and the economy. Drawing on country-based studies in Morocco, South Africa, Turkey, and Mexico, the analysis reveals difficult tradeoffs among various policy objectives, including priorities placed on different sectors, regional advantages, and general economic efficiency gains versus broader social impacts. The comparison of policy impacts demonstrates how policy makers can use such information to rank the policy interventions according to the emphasis placed on their objectives. The monograph also compares approaches used in other economy-wide studies that apply computable general equilibrium models in various contexts of water, environment, and agriculture.

A. Dinar. Water and Economy-Wide Policy Interventions. Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Microeconomics, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 85–165, 2014.
DOI: 10.1561/0700000059.

# 1

### Introduction

Water is a scarce resource in many arid and semi-arid regions, where economies are highly dependent on it. In many countries, due to climate and landscape conditions, water supply and demand nodes may be present in different geographical locations. Therefore, competition over and allocation of water involves serious policy considerations. The state faces difficult decisions regarding management and allocation of its water, as it is linked to land, environmental amenities, and development priorities.

Because of its central role in both developing and developed economies, water resources are the focus of many intervention policies. These policies have been aimed at achieving multiple objectives, including income transfer, food production security, environmental sustainability, and resource conservation. Since agriculture consumes the lion's share (70–90%) of annual renewable fresh water on earth it is a sufficient reason for policy makers to focus their efforts on improved performance of scarce water use in irrigated agriculture. While focusing on policies that target irrigated agriculture may lead to an immediate improvement in irrigation water use, still, other implications may negatively affect other water-using sectors, and indirectly also the agricultural sector. This system of cause and effect holds also for the urban water sector, as well as for the industrial and environmental sectors. The fact of the matter is that water, to a large extent, plays a central role as an intersectoral mechanism that has to be considered at the economy-wide level when being allocated among competing uses.

For quite some time, the economic literature analyzed impact of policy interventions by governments, using a plethora of policy interventions such as pricing, quotas, water right assignments, and development of water trading, but with focus only on a subset of water-using sectors [e.g., Johansson et al., 2002, Dinar and Saleth, 2005, Tsur et al., 2004a,b,c, Tiwari and Dinar, 2002]. Policy interventions could be water-directed (e.g., water regulations) or not water-directed (e.g., trade policies, labor policies, or other input policies). Another typology of policy intervention could be the level at which they are applied, namely as macro policies imposed on the state as a whole, or micro policies imposed on a region, on a sector, or on individuals (e.g., big farmers). But because interactions among sectors and factors of production are evident, the linkages between micro and macro policy interventions are far more important and allow policy makers to better assess the outcome of their interventions.

While policy interventions at the regional (micro) levels could lead to desirable results, local considerations may also lead to a suboptimal outcome, from a social point of view. This point is demonstrated in recent findings from works on economy-wide considerations and linkages [Roe et al., 2005a, Diao et al., 2008, Hassan et al., 2008, Cakmak et al., 2008, Yunez-Naude and Rojas Castro, 2008, Hassan and Thurlow, 2011]. It was found that reforms in sectors other than agriculture have major impacts on rural households' income, and that water reforms that are designed without taking into account reforms outside the major consumer of available water — irrigated agriculture — may lower overall productivity of irrigation water and have negative impact on the other sectors competing on that limited resource.

In recent years we have also witnessed increased globalization and climate change considerations, both of which strongly suggest that water policy is no longer a sectoral, or regional, but an economy-wide

### Introduction

matter. Recognizing this trend gave rise to studies of an economy-wide nature [see review in Dudu and Chumi, 2008, Johansson, 2005]. While many economy-wide analyses (mainly Computable General Equilibrium — CGE — models) have been published in the economic literature on water, little can be generalized mainly because these studies use different assumptions and structures of the economy. For example, many CGE studies on water that have been reported in the literature treat irrigated agriculture as one sector/activity. Such structures are only appropriate in economies where physical (soil quality, water availability, etc.), economic, and social conditions (crop mixes, proximity to markets, farm size, water delivery costs, etc.) are identical or similar across regions. However, existing spatial variation within economies makes that assumption of little use for simulation of real-world policy interventions.

Recognizing the importance of having the ability to assess different policy-linkage and performance interactions, this monograph considers policy interventions aimed at improving water allocation decisions, and assessing the impact on regions and sectors, by including both macro and micro considerations in a unified analytical framework. The monograph draws upon a recently completed set of country-based case studies on water management policy interventions in Morocco, South Africa, Turkey, and Mexico, all using a similar macro-micro CGE framework [Roe et al., 2005a,b, Diao et al., 2008, Hassan et al., 2008, Cakmak et al., 2008, Yunez-Naude and Rojas Castro, 2008, Hassan and Thurlow, 2011]. The country studies allow, for the first time, a comparison of a variety of policy interventions across various economic, institutional and physical situations, and generalization to situations and conditions in other countries. The results of the analyses of the macromicro linkage approach that was applied to Morocco, Mexico, South Africa, and Turkey are presented and contrasted so that the tradeoffs between different social allocation preferences are clearly identified in terms of their impact on sectoral productivity and welfare distribution, using economy-wide performance indicators. The monograph is concluded by identifying areas (e.g., climate change, globalization, food crisis, migration, distributional effects) in need for more research. It will provide a proposed framework for their inclusion in such analysis.

4

- M. Berrittella, Katrin Rehdanz, Roberto Roson, and Richard S. J. Tol. Virtual water trade in a general equilibrium analysis. Mimeo, 2005.
- M. Berrittella, Arjen Y. Hoekstra, Katrin Rehdanz, Roberto Roson, and Richard S. J. Tol. The economic impact of restricted water supply: A computable general equilibrium analysis. *Water Research*, 41:1799–1813, 2007a.
- M. Berrittella, Katrin Rehdanz, and Ricahrd S. J. Tol. The economic impact of the south-north water transfer project in china: A computable general equilibrium analysis. Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei Working Paper 72, 2007b.
- M. Berrittella, Katrin Rehdanz, Roberto Roson, and Richard S. J. Tol. The economic impact of water pricing: A computable general equilibrium analysis. Working Paper FNU-96, 2008a.
- M. Berrittella, Katrin Rehdanz, Roberto Roson, and Richard S. J. Tol. The economic impact of water taxes: A computable general equilibrium analysis with an international data set. *Water Policy*, 10:259–271, 2008b.
- M. Berrittella, Katrin Rehdanz, Richard S. J. Tol, and Jian Zhang. The impact of trade liberalization on water use: A computable general equilibrium analysis. *Journal of Economic Integration*, 23(3), 2008c.
- J. Blignaut and Jan van Heerden. The impact of water scarcity on economic development initiatives. *Water*, 35(4):415–420, 2008.
- J. Blignaut and Jan van Heerden. Is water shedding next? Working Paper Number 141, University of Pretoria, 2009.

- A. Briand. Marginal cost versus average cost pricing with climatic shocks in senegal: Dynamic computable general equilibrium model applied to water. Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei Working Paper 87, 2007.
- E. H. Cakmak, D. Hasan, S. Saracoglu, X. Diao, T. Roe, and Y. Tsur. Macromicro feedback links of irrigation water management in turkey. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 4781, 2008.
- A. Calzadilla, Katrin Rehdanz, and Richard S. J. Tol. The economic impact of more sustainable water use in agriculture: A computable general equilibrium analysis. *Journal of Hydrology*, 384:292–305, 2010.
- A. Calzadilla, Katrin Rehdanz, and Richard S. J. Tol. Water scarcity and the impact of improved irrigation management: A computable general equilibrium analysis. *Agricultural Economics*, 42(3):305–323, 2011a.
- A. Calzadilla, Katrin Rehndanz, and Richard S. J. Tol. Trade liberalization and climate change: A computable general equilibrium analysis of the impacts on global agriculture. *Water*, 3:526–550, 2011b.
- X. Diao and Terry Roe. The win-win effect of joint water market and trade reform on interest groups in irrigated agriculture in morocco. In A. Dinar, editor, *The Political Economy of Water Pricing Reforms*, pages 141–165. Oxford University Press, 2000.
- X. Diao and Terry Roe. Can a water market avert the "double whammy" of trade reform and lead to a "win-win" outcome? Journal of Environmental Economics and Management, 45(3), 2003.
- X. Diao, Terry Roe, and Rachid Doukkali. Economy-wide gains from the decentralized water allocation in a spatially heterogeneous agricultural economy. *Journal of Environment and Development Economics*, 13(4):371– 399, 2004.
- X. Diao, A. Dinar, T. Roe, and Y. Tsur. A general equilibrium analysis of conjunctive ground and surface water use with an application to morocco. *Agricultural Economics*, 38:117–135, 2008.
- A. Dinar. Economy-wide implications of direct and indirect policy interventions in the water sector: Lessons from recent work and future research needs. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 6068, May 2012. Accessed on January 6, 2013 at http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/ default/WDSContentServer/IW3P/IB/ 2012/05/08/000158349\_20120508 154801/Rendered/PDF/WPS6068.pdf.
- A. Dinar and M. Asad. Economic assessment of policy interventions in the water sector of México. World Bank México Department, Economic Sector Work, 2006. mimeo.

- A. Dinar and R. Maria Saleth. Issues in water pricing reforms: From getting correct prices to setting appropriate institutions. In Henk Folmer and Tom Tietenberg, editors, *The International Yearbook of Environmental and Resource Economics 2005/2006.* Edward Elgar, Cheltenham, UK, 2005.
- P. B. Dixon, S. Yu Schreider, and G. Wittwer. Encapsulation of water allocation into a general equilibrium model paper. presented to the International Congress on Water Research, 2005.
- P. B. Dixon, Maureen T. Rimmer, and Glyn Wittwer. Saving the Southern Murray Darling basin: The economic effects of a buyback of irrigation water. *Economic Record*, 87(276):153–168, 2011.
- H. Dudu and S. Chumi. Economics of irrigation water management: A literature survey with focus on partial and general equilibrium models. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 4556, 2008.
- H. Dudu, Erol H. Cakmak, and Sirin Saracoglu. Climate change and irrigation in Turkey: A CGE approach. *Iktisat Isletme ve Finans*, 25(286):9–33, 2010.
- G. Dwyer, Paul Loke, David Appels, Susan Stone, and Deborah Peterson. Integrating rural and urban water markets in South East Australia: Preliminary analysis. Presented to the OECD Workshop on Agriculture and Water: Sustainability, Markets and Policies. Adelaide, November 14–18, 2005.
- T. Gill and Cecilia Punt. The potential impact of increased irrigation water tariffs in South Africa. In African Association of Agricultural Economics, AAAE Third Conference/AEASA 48th Conference. Cape Town, South Africa, Sept. 19–23 2010.
- C. M. Gomezz, Dolores Tirado, and Javier Rey-Maquieira. Water exchanges versus water works: Insights from a computable general equilibrium model for the balearic islands. *Water Resources Research*, 40, 2004.
- D. J. Goodman. More reservoirs or transfers? a computable general equilibrium analysis of projected water shortages in the Arkansas river basin. *Journal of Agricultural and Resource Economics*, 25(2):698–713, 2000.
- R. Hassan and James Thurlow. Macro-micro feedback links of water management in South Africa: CGE analyses of selected policy regimes. Agricultural Economics, 42(2):235–247, 2011.
- R. Hassan, J. Thurlow, T. Roe, X. Diao, S. Chumi, and Y. Tsur. Macromicro feedback links of water management in South Africa: CGE analyses of selected policy regimes. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 4768, 2008.

78

- J. He, Xikang Chen, Yong Shi, and Aihua Li. Dynamic computable general equilibrium model and sensitivity analysis for shadow price of water resource in china. *Water Resource Management*, 21:1517–1533, 2007.
- R. E. Howitt and Josue Medelin-Azuara. Un modelo regional agrícola de equilibrio parcial: un enfoque equilibrio general. In *El Agua en México: El Caso de la Cuenca del Rio Bravo. El Trimestre Económico Lecturas*, volume 100, pages 151–182. Fondo del Cultura Económica, México, 2008.
- R. C. Johansson. Micro and macro-level approaches for assessing the value of irrigation water. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 3778, December 2005.
- R. C. Johansson, Yacov Tsur, Terry L. Roe, Rachid M. Doukkali, and Ariel Dinar. Pricing and allocation of irrigation water: A review of theory and practice. *Water Policy*, 4(2):173–199, 2002.
- J. S. Juana, K. M. Strzepek, and J. F. Kirsten. Households' welfare analyses of the impact of global change on water resources in South Africa. *Agrekon*, 47(3), 2008.
- A. R. Kaliba, Charles C. Ngugi, John M. Mackambo, Kajitanus O. Osewe, Ephraim Senkondo, Berno V. Mnembuka, and Steven Amisah. Potential effect of aquaculture promotion on poverty reduction in sub-saharan africa. *Aquaculture International*, 15:445–459, 2007.
- D. Kraybill. Adaptation to climate change in a rural economy with missing markets. In Selected paper prepared for presentation at the Agriculture and Applied Economics Association, 2010, AAEA, CAES and WAEA Joint Annual Meeting. Denver, Colorado, July 25–27 2010.
- D. Kraybill, Ivonne Diaz-Rodriguez, and Douglas Southgate. A computable general equilibrium analysis of rice market liberalization and water price rationalization in the Dominican Republic. In *Fourteenth International Conference on Input-Output Techniques*. University of Quebec, Montreal, Canada, October 10-15 2002.
- Y. Kunimitsu. Macroeconomic effects of the stock management for irrigation and drainage facilities in Japan: Application of recursive-dynamic CGE model. In Southern Agricultural Economics Association, 2011 Annual Meeting. Corpus Christi, TX, Feb 5–8 2011.
- A. J. Lennox and Olga Diukanova. Modelling regional general equilibrium effects and irrigation in Canterbury. *Water Policy*, 13(2):250–264, 2011.
- A. Letsoalo, J. Blignaut, T. De Wet, M. De Wit, S. Hess, R. Tol, and J. Van Herdeen. Double dividends of additional water consumption charges in South Africa. PREM Working Paper 05/01, 2005.

- A. Letsoalo, James Blignaut, Theuns de Wet, Martin de Wit, Sebastiaan Hess, Richard S. J. Tol, and Jan van Heerden. Triple dividends of water consumption charges in South Africa. *Water Resources Research*, 43, 2007.
- J. Luckmann, Khalid Siddig, Dorothee Flaig, and Harald Grethe. A general equilibrium approach to model water scarcity in israel. agricultural and food policy group. University of Hohenheim, Preliminary Paper, 2011.
- R. P. S. Malik. Do dams help reduce poverty? Journal of Indian Social and Agricultural Statistics, 61(2):199–207, 2007.
- D. Peterson, Gavan Dwyer, David Appels, and Jane Fry. Water trade in the southern murray-darling basin. *Economic Record*, 81(255):S115–S127, 2005.
- L. Phuwanich and Ruangrai Tokrisna. Economic policies for efficient water use in thailand. *Kasetsart Journal*, 28:367–376, 2007.
- T. Roe, Ariel Dinar, Yacov Tsur, and Xinshen Diao. Feedback links between economy-wide and farm-level policies: Application to irrigation water management in morocco. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 3550, 2005a.
- T. L. Roe, A. Dinar, Y Tsur, and X. Diao. Feedback links between economywide and farm-level policies: With application to irrigation water management in morocco. *Journal of Policy Modeling*, 27(8):905–928, 2005b.
- A. Rose and Shu-Yi Liao. Modeling regional economic resilience to disasters: A computable general equilibrium analysis of water service disruptions. *Journal of Regional Science*, 45(1):75–112, 2005.
- S. Schreider. Water price dynamics, water derivatives and general equilibrium modeling. In *Eighteenth World IMACS/MODSIM Congress*. Cairns, Australia, July 13–17 2009.
- C. K. Seung, Thomas R. Harris, Jeffrey E. Englin, and Noelwah R. Netusil. Impacts of water reallocation: A combined computable general equilibrium and recreation demand model approach. *Annals of Regional Science*, 34: 473–487, 2000.
- A. Smajgl. Quantitative evaluation of water use benefits an integrative modeling approach for the great barrier reef region. *Natural Resource Modeling*, 19(4), 2006.
- A. Smajgl, Romy Greiner, and Colin Mayocchi. Estimating the implications of water reform for irrigators in a sugar growing region. *Environmental Modeling and Software*, 21(9):1360–1367, 2006.

80

- A. Smajgl, S. Morris, and S. Heckbert. Water policy impact assessment combining modeling techniques in the Great Barrier Reef Region. Water Policy, 11:191–202, 2009.
- K. M. Strzepek, Gary W. Yohe, Richard S. J. Tol, and Mark W. Rosegrant. The value of the high Aswan Dam to the Egyptian economy. *Ecological Economics*, 66:117–126, 2008.
- D. Tirado, Carlos M. Gomez, and Javier Lozano. Efficiency improvements and water policy in the balearic islands: A general equilibrium approach. *Investigaciones Económicas*, 30(3):441–463, 2006.
- D. Tirado, Javier Lozano, and Carlos Mario Gomez. Economic regional impacts of water transfers: The role of factor mobility in a case study of the agricultural sector in the Balearic Islands. *Economía Agraria y Recursos Naturales*, 10(2):41–59, 2010.
- D. Tiwari and Ariel Dinar. Balancing future food demand and water supply: The role of economic incentives in irrigated agriculture. *Quarterly Journal* of International Agriculture, 41(1/2):77–97, 2002.
- Y. Tsur, A. Dinar, R. Doukkali, and T. Roe. Irrigation water pricing: Policy implications based on international comparison. *Environment and Devel*opment Economics, 9(6):735–755, 2004a.
- Y. Tsur, T. Roe, R. Doukkali, and A. Dinar. Pricing irrigation water in morocco. In Yacov Tsur, editor, *Chapter 7, Pricing Irrigation Water-Principles and Cases from Developing Countries.* RFF Press, Washington, DC, 2004b.
- Y. Tsur, T. Roe, R. Doukkali, and A. Dinar. Interaction between economywide policies and irrigated agriculture in morocco. In Yacov Tsur, editor, *Chapter 5, Pricing Irrigation Water-Principles and Cases from Developing Countries.* RFF Press, Washington, DC, 2004c.
- Jan H. van Heerden, James Blignaut, and Mark Horridge. Integrated water and economic modeling of the impacts of water market instruments on the South African economy. *Ecological Economics*, 66(1):105–116, 2008.
- E. Velázquez, M. Alejandro Cardenete, and Geoffrey J. D. Hewings. Water price and water reallocation in Andalusia: A computable equilibrium approach. Fundación Centro de Estudios Andaluces, (EC010/2005), 2005.
- A. Yunez-Naude and L. G. Rojas Castro. Perspectivas de la agricultura ante reducciones en la disponibilidad de agua para riego: Un enfoque equilibrio general. el agua en méxico: Consecuencias de las políticas de intervención en el sector. el trimestre económico lecturas 100:183-211. Fondo del Cultura Económica, México, 2008.